Greenhouse world and the Mesozoic Ocean

by

Reishi Takashima (rtaka@nature.sci.hokudai.ac.jp) is research fellow of Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Hokkaido University, Sapporo, Japan.

Hiroshi Nishi is Associate Professor of Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Hokkaido University, Sapporo, Japan.

Brian T. Huber is Curator at the Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of Natural History, Washington, DC, USA.

R. Mark Leckie is Professor at the University of Massachusetts, Amherst, Massachusetts, USA.

INTRODUCTION

The Earth’s climate has alternated between greenhouse (warm) and icehouse (cool) modes throughout the Phanerozoic (Fig. 1A). Earth is in the midst of an icehouse climate at present. Nevertheless, the rise of industrialization in the last two centuries has led to a dramatic increase in atmospheric CO$_2$ from the burning of fossil fuels, which, in turn, has led to significant global warming (e.g., Ruddiman, 2000). Global warming could profoundly impact human life because of various environmental changes, including global sea-level rise, more numerous and more powerful hurricanes and heavier rain and snow precipitation. Understanding the ocean–climate system during past greenhouse climate modes is essential for more accurate prediction of future climate and environmental changes in the warming Earth.

The Mesozoic–early Cenozoic is known as a typical greenhouse period caused largely by increased CO$_2$ from elevated global igneous activity (Fig. 1A–C). The mid-Cretaceous marked a major warming peak (Fig. 1D), as it is characterized by globally averaged surface temperatures that were >14°C higher than those of today (Tarduno et al., 1998), a lack of permanent ice sheets (Frakes et al. 1992) and ~100–200 m higher sea level than that of today (Haq et al., 1987; Miller et al., 2005a; Fig. 1E). Studies using DSDP (Deep Sea Drilling Program) and ODP (Ocean Drilling Program) cores have advanced our understanding of Mesozoic oceanography and climate. These studies demonstrated that Mesozoic ocean circulation and marine ecosystems differed greatly from those of today. This paper reviews significant achievements of DSDP and ODP research, and discusses future prospects of IODP (Integrated Ocean Drilling
Program) in the field of Mesozoic oceanography.

NEW INSIGHTS ON MESozoIC OCEANOGRAPHY FROM ODP AND DSDP RESEARCH

Determination of Mesozoic Ocean Temperature History

An important achievement of DSDP and ODP was the reconstruction of the history of Mesozoic ocean temperature changes based on geochemical methods such as oxygen isotopes, TEX86 and alkenone analyses. Oxygen isotope data have provided the greatest source of paleotemperature reconstructions from ancient oceans. However, the increasing prevalence of diagenetic alteration in older or more deeply buried rocks limits or prevents reliable isotopic data from biogenic calcite preserved in terrestrial outcrops. Compared to many land-based sections, calcareous microfossils of Cretaceous age recovered from samples drilled at DSDP and ODP sites are often better preserved, and usually have not been as seriously affected by complex tectonic and/or weathering processes. Exquisitely preserved foraminifera from the low-latitude Demerara Rise (ODP Site 1258–1261; 4–15°N), mid-latitude Blake Nose (ODP Sites 1049, 1050, 1052; 30°N) and high-latitude Falkland Plateau (DSDP Site 511; 60°S) have been especially useful for reconstructing vertical and latitudinal temperature gradients of the mid-through Late Cretaceous ocean (Figs. 2 & 3). The TEX86 method is especially useful for organic carbon-rich sediments, and has provided excellent paleo-temperature determinations (e.g., Schouten et al., 2003; Jenkyns et al., 2004).

According to isotopic records of surface dwelling planktic foraminifera, sea surface temperatures reached a maximum of 42°C at Demerara Rise (Bice et al., 2006), 33°C at Blake Nose (Huber et al., 2002), and 31°C at Falkland Plateau (Huber et al., 2002; Bice et al., 2003) during the Turonian (Figs. 2 & 3). At comparable latitudes in the modern ocean, August surface water temperatures are 25–28°C at 0–20°N, 20–28°C at 20–40°N, and 0–5°C at 60°S (Thurman and Trujillo, 1999). These data consequently suggest that Cretaceous warming was most prominent at high latitudes where the difference of temperature between the mid-Cretaceous and the present oceans is nearly 30°C (Fig. 2). Bice and Norris (2002) estimate that at least 4500 ppm CO₂ is required to match the above-mentioned maximum temperatures, which is >11 times the modern atmospheric concentration. Using a more recent climate model Bice et al. (2006) conclude that 3500
ppm or greater atmospheric CO$_2$ concentration is required to reproduce the estimated maximum sea surface temperatures of the Mesozoic tropical ocean.

Since the Mesozoic paleo-temperature estimates based on geochemical proxies are still insufficient in sediments older than Albian and in the areas outside of the Atlantic Ocean, further investigations are needed to reconstruct a reliable spatial and temporal temperature history during the greenhouse climate of the Mesozoic.

**Oceanic Anoxic Events**

Defining the concept of Oceanic Anoxic Events (OAEs) was one of the most important achievements of the early DSDP. Cretaceous marine sediments in Europe are mainly made up of white limestone and chalk; however, distinct black, laminated organic rich layers, termed “black shales”, are occasionally intercalated within these sequences (Fig. 4). Because organic carbon is preferentially preserved under anoxic conditions, earlier workers suggested that these black shales had accumulated locally in a weakly ventilated, restricted basin under regional anoxic conditions. In the mid-1970s, however, the discovery of black shales at many DSDP drill sites from the Atlantic, Indian and Pacific Oceans led to recognition of widespread anoxic conditions in the global ocean spanning limited stratigraphic horizons (Fig. 5). Schlanger and Jenkyns (1976) termed these widespread depositional black shale intervals “Oceanic Anoxic Events” (OAEs).

Burial of organic carbon, which preferentially sequesters isotopically light carbon during OAEs, resulted in a positive δ$^{13}$C ($^{13}\text{C}/^{12}\text{C}$) excursion of 2-3‰ in the geologic record (Fig. 3). Even if black shales are not visible in terrestrial rocks such as dark gray-to-black-colored mudstones, carbon isotope excursions are a useful marker for recognizing the OAEs (Takashima et al., 2004). Recent advances in biostratigraphy and correlation using carbon isotopes have revealed that OAEs occurred at least 8 times in the Cretaceous and at 1 to 4 times in the Jurassic (Fig. 3). The Toarcian OAE, Weissert OAE, OAE 1a and OAE 2 are global scale anoxic events associated with prominent positive excursions of δ$^{13}$C and worldwide distribution of black shales (Fig. 3).

Two models, that of a stagnant ocean or expansion of the oxygen-minimum layer, have been proposed to explain the formation of black shales in the OAEs (e.g., Pedersen and Calvert, 1990). The stagnant ocean model (STO model) attributes OAEs to depletion of bottom water oxygen as a result of dense vertical stratification of the ocean
A modern analogue is seen in stratified silled-basins such as the Black Sea. The expanded oxygen-minimum layer model (OMZ model) proposes that increased surface ocean productivity caused expansion of the oxygen minimum layer in the water column (Fig. 6B). Upwelling sites such as the Moroccan and Peruvian margins provide a modern analogue for this model.

These two models predict different vertical thermal gradient profiles of the water column that can be inferred from the oxygen isotope of planktic and benthic foraminifera. For example, the OAE 1b in the earliest Albian (about 112 Ma) is characterized by a sudden increase in surface water temperatures and strengthening of the vertical stratification of the water column (Erbacher et al., 2001), suggesting similarity to the STO model (Fig. 7A). On the other hand, the OAE 2 (about 94 Ma) shows sudden warming of deep-water and collapse of vertical stratification (Huber et al., 1999), which probably induced enhanced upwelling and productivity similar to the expanded OMZ model (Fig. 7B). Warming of deep-waters may have contributed to a decrease in oxygen solubility in the deep ocean, as well as triggering the disassociation of large volumes of methane hydrate buried in sediments of the continental margins. Oxidation of the released methane could have further consumed dissolved oxygen in the water column, while simultaneously releasing CO₂ to the atmosphere (Gale, 2000; Jahren, 2002). However, since there really is no modern analog for global ocean anoxia, these models suffer from the lack of an analog.

OAEs have had a significant influence on the evolution and diversity of ancient marine communities through the Phanerozoic. Numerous records demonstrate a high turnover rate of microfossils at or near OAE intervals (Jarvis et al., 1988; Erbacher et al., 1996; Premoli Silva and Sliter, 1999; Leckie et al., 2002; Erba, 2004). During the Cenomanian-Turonian (C/T) boundary OAE 2, for example, anoxic environments expanded from the photic zone (Damsté and Köster, 1998; Pancost et al., 2004) to >3500 m depth in the Atlantic (Thurow et al., 1992), resulting in about 20% extinction of marine organisms in various habitats within an interval of less than 1 million years (Fig. 1F). Black shales in the OAEs, especially OAE 1a and OAE 2, frequently yield no calcareous nanofossils, planktic foraminifera or radiolarians, suggesting that anoxic conditions had expanded to within the euphotic zone of the surface water column (e.g. Hart and Leary, 1991; Coccioni and Luciani, 2005). Discovery of abundant cyanobacteria biomarkers (e.g., Kuypers et al., 2004), nonthermophilic archaea (e.g.,
Kuypers et al., 2001), and green sulfur bacteria (e.g., Damesté and Köster, 1998) within the black shales provides strong support for this hypothesis. These proxies further indicate that anoxic conditions occasionally occurred at very shallow water depths during the C/T OAE.

OAEs also served as an effective thermostat for the greenhouse Earth. Since the change in organic burial in the pelagic sections for OAEs was 2 to 3 orders of magnitude greater than the mean conditions at other time interval, burial of massive organic carbon during OAEs may have drawn down CO$_2$ from the ocean–atmosphere by burying organic carbon in black shales thereby punctuating long-term global warmth (e.g., Arthur et al., 1988; McElwain et al., 2005). The Late Devonian anoxic event could be an extreme example where widespread anoxia caused not only significant biotic extinction (about 40%), but also induced glaciation after deposition of black shales (Caplan and Bustin, 2001).

OAEs have benefited human life because they are a major cause of the large volumes of oil and gas that we consume today. These hydrocarbons were derived from organic-rich sediments that formed under anoxic conditions. Indeed, many petroleum source rocks were formed during in greenhouse warming peaks between the Late Jurassic and mid-Cretaceous (Fig. 1G).

**Mesozoic sea level changes and existence of ice-sheet**

Rising sea level attributed to global warming is one of the most serious and imminent problems for mankind because of the concentration of human populations on the coastal plains. Fluctuations in global sea level result from changes in the volume of ocean or the volume of ocean basins. The former depends mainly on the growth and decay of continental ice sheets and fluctuates on short ($10^4–10^6$ year) time scales. On the other hand, the latter fluctuates on longer ($10^7–10^8$ year) time scales resulting from tectonic effects such as variations in seafloor spreading rates, ocean ridge lengths and collision/break-up of continents (e.g., Ruddiman, 2000; Miller et al., 2005a, b). Because the Mesozoic period exhibited the break-up of Gondwana, primarily ice-free climates, high rates of seafloor spreading, as well as the emplacement of large igneous plateaus on the ocean floor, the Mesozoic ocean was characterized by much higher sea level than at present. Sea level peaked in mid- to Late Cretaceous time (~100–75 Ma), during which continents were flooded more than 40% in area of present land resulting in the
expansion of continental shelf environments and intra-continental seaways (e.g., Hays and Pittmann III, 1973; Fig. 5).

The most widely cited reconstructions of past sea level changes were established by Exxon Production Research Company (EPR) (Haq et al., 1987), which have been updated in the past decade (e.g., Hardenbol et al., 1998). These sea level curves consist of short- \((10^5–10^6 \text{ year})\) and long-term \((10^7–10^8 \text{ year})\) curves that are correlated with detailed chrono-, bio- and magnetostratigraphies for last 250 million years (Fig. 3). According to the EPR curves, Late Cretaceous sea level rose as much as 260 m above the present level. The EPR curves, however, have been criticized because of the following reasons: 1) the supporting data are proprietary, 2) the sequence boundaries cannot be translated into a eustatic origin, and 3) inferred amplitudes of sea level fluctuations seem to be conjectural (e.g., Christie-Blick et al., 1995). ODP drilling on the New Jersey passive continental margin (ODP 174AX) provided new insights into the amplitudes of, and mechanisms for, sea level changes for last 100 Ma. The area around the drilling sites is an excellent location for sea level studies because of quiescent tectonics and well-constructed biostratigraphic and Sr isotopic age control (Sugarman et al., 1995). The proposed sea level curve by the New Jersey drilling is well correlated with those of Russian platform and EPR curves, but the estimated maximum global sea level amplitude is \(~100 \text{ m}\) during Late Cretaceous (Miller et al., 2005a; Fig. 3), which is contrast to the much greater estimate by EPR.

Since the Mesozoic greenhouse period is generally assumed to have been equably ice-free interval, it has long been debated about the mechanism for the large and rapid changes observed in Cretaceous sea level (e.g., Skelton et al., 2003). Miller and his colleagues demonstrated that several rapid sea level falls recorded in New Jersey could be explained only by glacio-eustacy (Miller et al., 1999; 2005a). According to integration between occurrences of ice-rafted and/or glacial deposits around the polar regions, positive oxygen isotope values of foraminifera and intervals of rapid sea level fall, it is quite possible that the glacial events did occur during greenhouse climate. Although there still remains uncertainty in age and ice volume, several geologically short-term glacial events during Cretaceous have been proposed (e.g., middle Cenomanian [96 Ma], middle Turonian [92–93 Ma], middle Campanian, and earliest and late Maastrichtian [71 and 66.1 Ma]). These results imply that greenhouse periods had much greater short-term climatic variability instead of previously proposed
long-term stable and equable climates.

**Biocalcification crises during the Mesozoic ocean**

The Mesozoic is marked by the poleward expansion shallow-water carbonate platforms as well as several occurrences of their global “drowning” or “collapse” events (e.g., Johnson et al., 1998; Simo et al., 1993). These drowning events were not due to sea level rise because shallow-water carbonate platforms usually grow-up much faster than sea level fluctuation. Although eutrophication of surface oceans associated OAEs were considered to be the cause of these drowning events, ODP Legs 143 and 144 revealed that some shallow-water carbonate platforms survived during OAE 1a in the central Pacific (Wilson et al., 1998). Weissert and Erba (2004) pointed out that the coincidence between drowning events of shallow-water carbonate platforms and the crisis of heavily calcified plankton groups, and termed these events “Biocalcification crises”. Although the mechanism responsible for biocalcification crises remains poorly constrained, recent hypotheses blame elevated pCO$_2$-induced lowered surface ocean pH, which affected carbonate-secreting organisms (e.g., Leckie et al., 2002; Weissert and Erba, 2004).

**FUTURE PROSPECTS OF THE IODP FOR MESOZOIC OCEANOGRAPHY**

The greenhouse climate of the mid-Cretaceous was likely related to major global volcanism and associated outgassing of CO$_2$. OAEs may be recognized as a negative feedback in response to sudden warming episodes, by preventing further acceleration of warming through removal of organic carbon from the ocean-atmosphere (CO$_2$) reservoir to sediment reservoirs. This process resulted in the emplacement of a large volume of organic matter during the mid-Cretaceous, which now serves as a major source of fossil fuels (Larson, 1991). However, present human activities are rapidly consuming these fuels, returning the carbon to the ocean-climate system. Pre-industrial CO$_2$ levels of about 280 ppm have increased over the past 200 years to the current levels exceeding 380 ppm, mainly as a result of human activities. Bice et al. (2006) estimated that Cretaceous atmospheric concentration ranged between 600 and 2400 ppm, 1.5 to 6 times the present concentration. If the current rate of CO$_2$ increase continues, Cretaceous values may be attained within 1500–6000 years, but current trends are already having clear affects on the both the ocean-climate system and the biosphere. In
fact, a recent ocean-climate model predicts that rapid atmospheric release of CO$_2$ will produce changes in ocean chemistry that could affect marine ecosystems significantly, even under future pathways in which most of the remaining fossil fuel CO$_2$ is never released (Caldeira and Wickett, 2005).

Improved understanding of the Mesozoic ocean-climate system and formation of OAEs are important to better predict environmental and biotic changes in a future greenhouse world. However, Cretaceous DSDP and ODP cores with continuous recovery and abundant well-preserved fossils suitable for isotopic study are very limited. A denser global array of deep-sea cores is needed to provide more detailed reconstructions of global climate changes and oceanographic conditions in order to better understand the ocean-climate dynamics of the Mesozoic greenhouse Earth. Though far from complete, the Mesozoic record is much better studied in areas of the Atlantic Ocean and Tethys Sea than in the Indo–Pacific Oceans because most of ocean-floor formed in Mesozoic time has already subducted under continents. Therefore, much less is known about Mesozoic paleoceanographic condition in the Indo-Pacific (Bralower et al., 1993). The Mesozoic marine sequences deposited at middle–high latitudes of the Pacific, such as the continental margin of eastern Asia and the Bering Sea, are appropriate future drilling targets. Submerged continental rift sites such as the Somali Basin should also be targeted as they record a continuous paleoceanographic history from the Early Cretaceous or older. We expect that new IODP research from these Cretaceous sites could provide new insights to the process of abrupt global warming and its impact on the Earth’s biosphere.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We express sincere gratitude to Dr. R. Coccioni for provided photograph of black shales in Italy. Extremely helpful reviews by two anonymous reviewers and Drs. R. Burger and K. Fujioka helped to improve the quality of the manuscript.

REFERENCES


Coccioni, R. and V. Luciani. 2005. Planktonic foraminifers across the Bonarelli Event (OAE2, latest Cenomanian): The Italian record. Palaeogeography,


Journal of Science 301: 112-149.
Morettini, E., M. Santantonio, A. Bartolini, F. Cecca, P. O. Baumgartner and J. C. Hunziker. 2002. Carbon isotope stratigraphy and carbonate production during the


**Figure Caption**

**Figure 1:** Compilation showing the changes in climate, geological and paleontological events through the Phanerozoic.

**Figure 2:** Latitudinal variations of surface ocean paleo-temperature derived from oxygen isotopes of planktonic foraminifera and TEX$_{86}$. Modified from Bice et al. (2003), Huber et al. (2002) and Jenkyns et al. (2004).


**Figure 4:** Cretaceous black shales intercalated in pelagic limestone sequence, central Italy. Provided by R. Coccioni.

**Figure 5:** Distribution of black shales and/or increased organic carbon sediments at OAE 2. Data are from Schlanger et al. (1987), Arthur et al. (1987; 1988),

Figure 6: Representative models for black shale deposition. (A) stagnant ocean model, (B) oxygen minimum-layer model.

Figure 7: Vertical ocean temperature structure, reconstructed from oxygen isotopes, during (I) OAE 1b (Erbacher et al., 2001) and (II) OAE 2 (Huber et al., 1999) intervals at the Blake Nose, western North Atlantic.
(G) Percent of world’s original petroleum reserves generated by source rocks (Klemme & Ulminshek, 1991)

(F) Percentage extinction of marine genera (Raup & Sepkoski, 1986) & major Oceanic Anoxic Events

(E) Sea level changes & continental glaciation (Ridgwell, 2005)

(D) Temperature (Frakes et al., 1992)

(C) Carbon dioxide
Ratio of the mass of atmospheric CO₂ at a past time to that at present (Berner, in press)

(B) Production rate of oceanic crust (Stanley, 1999)

(A) Climate mode (Frakes et al., 1992)

Fig. 1, Takashima et al.
Mid-Cretaceous sea-surface temperature gradient

Legend
- other core sites
- ODP/DSDP sites
- Maastrichtian
- Turonian
- Cenomanian
- late Albian

Fig. 2, Takashima et al.
Fig. 3, Takashima et al.
Fig. 4, Takashima et al.
Fig. 5, Takashima et al.
(A) Stagnent ocean model
- Anoxic Black Shales
- Oxic
- Strengthened thermocline

(B) Expanded oxygen minimum layer model
- Oxic
- Weakened thermocline
- High productivity
- Anoxic nutrient
- Oxic Black Shales

Fig. 6, Takashima et al.
### OAE 1b (Strengthened water column stratification)

**Aptian Lower**
- **Lithology:** Marl
- **Depth (mbsf):** 142
- **Foraminifera:** Hedbergella planispira

**Aptian Upper**
- **Lithology:** Marl
- **Depth (mbsf):** 144

### OAE 2 (Collapse of water column stratification)

**Cenomanian Turonian Stages**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stages</th>
<th>Lithology</th>
<th>Foraminifera</th>
<th>Oxygen Isotope Records $\delta^{18}O_{\text{foraminifera}}$ (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Legend**
- Shallower habitant
- Deeper habitant
- Benthic foraminifera
- Black shale
- Marl
- Limestone
- Slump

**Fig. 7, Takashima et al.**