Instructions for use

Title
The Use of Chinese Words of Colloquial origin in the Nihon Shoki

Author(s)
Tang, Wei

Citation
Journal of the Graduate School of Letters, 5: 65-80

Issue Date
2010-03

Doc URL
http://hdl.handle.net/2115/42865

Type
bulletin (article)

File Information
JGSL5_004.pdf

Hokkaido University Collection of Scholarly and Academic Papers : HUSCAP
The Use of Chinese Words of Colloquial origin in the Nihon Shoki

TANG Wei

Abstract: Nihon shoki 日本書紀 made use of colloquial and vernacular terms. As regards the native Japanese or Xundu-readings (訓讀) of these Chinese words and phrases, there exists a body of extensive research, typified by the work of Kanda Kiichirō, in which it has been emphasized that the so-called early Xundu-readings of the Nihon shoki were carefully chosen with reference to Chinese commentaries and that this precision also extended to colloquial and vernacular expressions1. However, the examination of how passages in the Nihon shoki containing Chinese colloquial and vernacular expressions from the Nan-Bei period to the Tang 唐 have been read has been inadequate, and it is from such a perspective that in this article the author wish to consider disyllabic adverbs and examine the realities of the early signs and symbols used to indicate diacritical notes and marks (訓點) in the Nihon shoki.

(Received on December 5, 2009)

1. Introduction

In any previous studies of the compilation of the Nihon shoki 日本書紀 it has been pointed out that the compilers borrowed heavily from Chinese works and Buddhist texts such as the Hanshu 漢書, Hou Hanshu 後漢書, Sanguozhi 三國志 (except for the Shuzhi 蜀志), Liangshu 梁書, Suishu 隋書, Yiwen leiju 芸文類聚, Wenxuan 文選 and Suvarṇaprabhāsottama-sūtra (Jinguan-gming zuishengwang jing 金光明最勝王經) and also made use of colloquial and vernacular terms. As regards the native Japanese or kun 訓 readings (kundoku 訓讀) of these Chinese words and phrases, there exists a body of extensive research, typified by the work of Kanda Kiichirō, in which it has been emphasized that the so-called early kun readings of the Nihon shoki were carefully chosen with reference to Chinese commentaries and that this precision also extended to colloquial and vernacular expressions1. However, the examination of how passages in the Nihon shoki containing Chinese colloquial and vernacular expressions from the Wei 魏 and Jin 晉 through to the Tang 唐 have been read has been inadequate, and it is from such a perspective that

---

1 See Kanda 1949 and Matsuo 1986b.

©2010 by the Graduate School of Letters, Hokkaido University
TANG Wei: tangwei@lit.let.hokudai.ac.jp
in this article I wish to consider disyllabic adverbs and examine the realities of the early signs and symbols used to indicate kun readings (kunten 訓点) in the Nihon shoki.

As an be seen in the mid-Heian 平安 kunten of the Iwasaki 岩崎 manuscript of the Nihon shoki, there is evidence that serious consideration was given to the question of whether to read disyllabic expressions in the Nihon shoki as one word or two words in Japanese (Ishizuka 1985, 1986). It is therefore worth examining how these disyllables were read in early manuscripts of the Nihon shoki, such as the Iwasaki manuscript, that had been marked for reading in Japanese. In surveying the origins of the disyllables to be considered below, use has been made of digital data for Chinese texts, Buddhist scriptures and Dunhuang 敦煌 transformation texts (bianwen 変文), but my primary objective has been to elucidate the actual kun readings of passages in the Nihon shoki in which these disyllables have been incorporated.

The words to be considered in the following are, first, 35 disyllabic adverbs among the 104 words taken up by Matsuo Yoshiki (1986b) (listed here in the order of their Japanese Kan-on 漢音)

一時 亦覆 益復 應時 何當 各自 潤復 極甚 元來 更不 更無 事須 實是 少々 觸事 觸路 即便 即自 即時 大有 覺爾 都不 都無 當時 當須 獨自 倍復 必應 必思 必當 並不 便即 本自 猶復 然須

and, secondly, further 19 words added by the present writer:

更亦 更復 最為 再三 茲甚 皆悉 威皆 共同 勿復 豈復 自然 悉皆 時復 正在 必自 無復 不復 並悉 並是

2. Kun Readings of Disyllabic Adverbs

I. Cases in which disyllables have been read as one word:

I-1. Instances in which disyllables have been given a kun reading

I-2. Instances in which only combining marks have been added

II. Cases in which disyllables have not been read as one word:

II-1. Instances in which disyllables have not been read as one word and the kun reading is inappropriate

II-2. Instances in which disyllables have not been read as one word but the sense is not all that wide of the mark or else unclear Explanatory Remarks

Passages from the Nihon shoki are quoted from the two-volume Nihon koten bungaku taikei 日本古典文学大系 (Iwanami Shoten 岩波書店) edition, while only the necessary sections of the Japanese rendering are cited from early manuscripts with kunten. The numerals following passages quoted from the Nihon shoki indicate the fascicle, page, and line (with fascicles 1–15 in

---

2 With regard to the kunten added to disyllabic adverbs in the Nihon shoki that originated in colloquial Chinese, on a previous occasion (Tang 2004) I took up six expressions of degree and pointed out that in many cases they were not read as disyllables. As reasons for this, I suggested a lack of understanding of colloquialisms and the fact that Japanese readings of Chinese characters had already become fixed.
Vol. 1 and fascicles 16–30 in Vol. 2 of the Iwanami edition). The kana 仮名 signs used in the manuscripts are given in katakana 片仮名, while the special diacritics known as wokoten ワコト点 are indicated in hiragana 平仮名, and supplementary readings provided by the author are enclosed in parentheses. Combining marks and punctuation marks are given as they appear in the manuscripts. The manuscripts of the Nihon shoki used below include the Iwasaki manuscript with mid-Heian kunten, the Maeda 前田 manuscript with kunten from the Insei 院政 period, the Zushoryō 図書寮 manuscript with kunten from Eiji 永治 2 (1142), the Kitano 北野 manuscript with kunten from the early Kamakura 鎌倉 period and the Kanekata 兼方 manuscript with kunten from the Kōan 弘安 era (1278–88), while other sources have been indicated as required.

I. Cases in Which Disyllables Have Been Read as One Word

I–1. Instances in which disyllables have been given a kun reading

1. 一時 2. 益復 3. 元来 4. 再三(some instances) 5. 自然

[I–1.1] Yishi 一時

①一時刺虜。而坐定酒行。(III: 205.7)

Atsuta 熱田 manuscript (Nanbokuchō 南北朝 kunten): 一時

②時我卒聞歌、倶抜其頭椎鬚、一時殺虜。(III: 205.10)

Atsuta manuscript: 一時

③是以、諸國一時賈上下五百船。(X: 377.19)

Atsuta manuscript: 一時

④筋力精神、一時勞竭。(XIV: 499.17)

Maeda manuscript: 一時

⑤極民塗炭、彼此一時。(XVII: 37.9)

Maeda manuscript: 一時

⑥入鹿、終興子弟妃妾一時自絢俱死也。(XXIV: 253.11)

Iwasaki manuscript: 一時

⑦一時俱鑲十二通門、勿使往來。(XXIV: 263.10)

Iwasaki manuscript: 一時

⑧唯吹負留謂、立名于一時、欲寧艱難。(XXVIII: 393.14)

Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunten): no kunten

A search of the Guosue baodian 国学宝典 for examples of colloquial usage in Chinese texts elicits the following results: Hanshu −0; Hou Hanshu −22; Jinshu −119; Liangshu −24; Weishu −59; Suisu −35; Youxiangu 遊仙窟 −4. These include:

珍國之、一時土崩、(Liangshu 1)
但筋力精神、一時揃竭。(Suishu 2)

Youxiangu, Daigoji 醍醐寺 manuscript (kunten from 1344):

眾人皆大笑、一時俱坐、「一時」
一時大笑。「一時」
又一時大笑。「一時」
死去一時休、「一時」
A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka for examples in Buddhist texts elicits 12,685 examples (including nouns; among the 133 examples in the Huayan 華嚴 section, 61 are adverbs). These include the following 2 examples:

一時演説。悉亦如是。(Avatamsaka-sūtra [tr. Śīkṣānanda] 39; T. 10: 207)

There are 49 examples in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu 敦煌變文校注, which include the following 2 examples:

一時打其鼓不鳴。(Li Ling bianwen 李陵變文 p. 128)
将士聞言、一時入草。(ibid.)

[I-1.3] Yuanlai 元來
①即日、勅曰、元來諸家貽於神府寶物、今皆還其子孫。(XXIX: 417.7)
  Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunten): 「元_來」
  Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunten): 「元來」
②時新羅言、新羅奉勅入者、元來用蘇剌位。(XXX: 497.10)
  Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunten): no kunten.
③又新羅元來奏云、我國、自日本遠皇祖代、(XXX: 497.14)
  Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunten): 「元_來」

A search of the Guoxue baodian 国学宝典 for examples of colloquial usage in Chinese texts elicits the following result: Hanshu −0; Hou Hanshu −0; Jinshu −0; Liangshu −0; Weishu −1; Suishu −0; Youxiankan −5. These include:

置上元來盡所求年。(Weishu 170)

Youxiankan, Daigoji manuscript:

元來不見、他自尋常、「元_來」
元來無次弟、請五嫂為作酒翁、「元_來」
元來知難、未敢承望、「元_來」
李樹子、元來不是偏、巧知娘子意、擰果到渠邊。「元_來」
元來不相識、判自斷知聞、「元_來」

A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits no examples, but there are six examples in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu, which include the following 2 examples:

法界元來本清淨、都不關他空不空。(Foshuo Amituo jing jiangjing wen 佛說阿彌陀經講經文 2, p. 685)

地獄元來是我家。(Damuqianlian mingqian jiiumu bianwen 大目乾連冥間救母變文, p. 1031)

[I-1.4] Zaisan 再三 (some instances)
①愛無以過。如是相譏再三。(XV: 511.17)
  Zushoryō manuscript: no kunten
  Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunten): 「相_譏(リタマフコト)再_三」
②百濟使將軍君等、在於堂下。凡數月再三、(XVII: 39.18)
  Maeda manuscript: 「數_月_再_三」
③任那早岐等對曰、前再三砲、與新羅譏。(XIX: 69.15)
Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunten):「再_三砲」
Kanbun 寛文 9 (1669) edition:「再_三_砲」
④以中臣鎌子連拜神祇伯。再三四識不就。(XXIV: 253.19)
Iwasaki manuscript:「再_三_砲」
Zushoryō manuscript:「再_三_砲」
⑤輕皇子、再三四識。(XXV: 269.15)
Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunten):「再_三_砲」
In the above examples of zaisan, it is read as one word in ④ and ⑤ and as two words in ①, ② and ③. It was presumably because it was widely used in classical Chinese as a disyllable that it was able to be read as one word in early kunten manuscripts of the Nihon shoki.
A search of the Guoxue baodian elicits the following examples: Hanshu −3; Hou Hanshu −0; Jinshu −1; Liangshu −1; Weishu −1; Suishu −7; Youxian −0, These include:
一日再三出。(Hanshu 51)
再三返覆之。(Weishu 88)
令美人再三吟詠。(Suishu 22)
再三鎮推。(Zutangji 2)
A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits 842 examples. There are no examples in the Suvarṇaprabhāsottama-sūtra, which had close links with the compilation of the Nihon shoki, but the following three examples may be cited:
再三索財。小母答如初。(Dirghāgama [tr. Buddhayaśas and Zhu Fonian 竺佛念 in Hongshi 弘始 era of Later Qin 後秦] 7; T. 1: 46)
我再三告言。聞利內大樂。(Mahāparinirvāṇa-sūtra [tr. Bai Fazu 白法祖 of Western Jin] 1; T. 1: 165)
如是再三求哀乞。(Pusa chutai jing 菩薩處胎經 [tr. Zhu Fonian of Yao-Qin 姚秦] 7; T. 12: 1048)
There are 20 examples in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu, which include the following 4 examples:
遠公既蒙再三邀請。(Lushan Yuongong hua 廬山遠公話, P. 268)
求守鐔子拓枷、鐔子再三不肯。(Yanzi fu 燕子賦, P. 378)
是日耶輸再三請、太子當時臂指環。(Taizì chengdao jing 太子成道經, P. 435)
太子問聞死轉愁眉、再三怨恨實可悲。(Baxiang bianwen 八相變文 1, p. 512)
According to Gao Wei (1985), zai 再 and san 三 were originally numbers, but when joined together they formed an adverb, with the meanings of the two elements combining to signify “frequency”, “repetition” or “excessiveness”, and they lost their original meanings of “two” and “three”. The kun reading shikiri ni シキリに given in examples ④ and ⑤ above is apposite.

[I-1.5] Ziran 自然
①単自然有可怜小汀。(II: 165.12)
Kanekata manuscript:「自_然」
②自然沈去。(II: 177.15)
Kanekata manuscript:「自_然」
③而自然言之、玉華鎮石。出雲人祭。(V: 253.13)
Atsuta manuscript:「自_然」
④與自然言之、玉華鎮石。出雲人祭 (V: 253.13)
④清彦答曰，「昨夕，刀子自然至欧臣家。」(VI: 279.13)
    Atsuta manuscript: 「自 然に」

⑤是後，出石刀子、自然至于泥路癪。(VI: 279.14)
    Kitano manuscript (kunten by Kanenaga 兼永): 「自然に」

⑥布彌支・半古、四邑、自然降服。(IX: 357.9)
    Atsuta manuscript: 「自 然」

⑦若已建任那、移那斯・麻都、自然却退。(XIX: 85.17)
    Kitano manuscript (Nambokuchô kunten): 「自 然」

⑧太佐平・王子等来。即自然心生於伏。(XX: 145.17)
    Maeda manuscript: 「自 然に」

⑨自然増益、三百餘丈。(XXIX: 465.16)
    Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunten): 「自然に」
    Kitano manuscript (Nambokuchô kunten): 「自 然」

    A search of the Guoxue baodian for examples of colloquial usage elicits the following results:
    Hanshu: 0; Hou Hanshu: 4; Jinshu: 18; Liangshu: 5; Weishu: 11; Suishu: 6; Youxian-ku: 2.
    These include the following 4 examples:
    - 知妖逆之徒自然消清也。(Jinshu 28)
    - 若載運不通、自然離散。(Liangshu 1)

Youxian-ku, Daigoji manuscript:
    天衣錦體、自然浮出、「自 - 然」
    自然能舉止、可念無比方。「自 - 然」
    A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits 11,968 examples (including nouns; among the 127 examples in Vol. 2 of the Āgama section, 63 are adverbs). These include the following 2 examples:
    栗自然例裂。(Dirghāgama [tr. Buddhayaśas and Zhu Fonian in Hongshī era of Later Qin] 18; T. 1: 121)
    大寶自然而至。(Saddarmacarikā-sūtra [tr. Kumārajiva of Later Qin] 2; T. 9: 17)
    There are 17 examples in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu, which include the following 2 examples:
    災祥自然消散 (Yanzi fu 1, p. 376)
    體塖而琉璃不異、自然清淨。(Weimojie jing jiangjing wen 維摩詣經講經文 1, p. 751)

[1–1.9] Jibian 即便
①以禱觸體、即便懆脤。(XIV: 463.12)
    Maeda and Zushoryō manuscripts: 「即 備」

②即便流弊然矣、纏心歌曰。(XVI: 13.11)
    Zushoryō manuscript: no kunten

③馬子宿禥、即便隨去 (XXI: 157.19)
    Zushoryō manuscript: no kunten
    Kitano manuscript (Nambokuchô kunten): 「即 便」

    A search of the Guoxue baodian elicits the following results: Hanshu: 0, Hou Hanshu: 3; Jinshu: 7; Liangshu: 0, Weishu: 5; Youxian-ku: 0. These include the following 2
examples:
    堂勒兵迫討、即便奔散。(Hou Hanshu 31)
    臣被詔之日、即便東下。(Jinshu 42)

A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits 6,516 examples, which include the following 2 examples:
    懐息比丘即便臥息。(Dirghāgama [tr. Buddhayaśas and Zhu Fonian in Hongshi era of Later Qin] 9; T. 1: 55)
    即便虜逐令出國界。(Mahāparinirvāṇa-sūtra [tr. Dhāmakṣema of Northern Liang 北涼]; T. 12: 378)

There are 25 examples in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu, which include the following 2 examples:
    今來助國、即便拜為左相。(Qiu Hu bianwen 秋胡變文, p. 233)
    太子見已、即便驚忙。(Baxiang bianwen 1, p. 510)

According to the Gudai hanyu xuci cidian 古代漢語虛詞詞典, ji 即 and bian 便 are synonymous, and together they form a compound adverb of time meaning “immediately”. The kun reading sunafachi スナハチ given in example ① above is apposite.

[I-1.11] Benzi 本自
①本自荒芒。(I: 129.22)

Kanekata manuscript: 本_自荒芒

A search of the Guosue baodian elicits the following results: Hanshu -1; Hou Hanshu -7, Jinshu -3; Liangshu -2; Weishu -8; Suishu -3; Youxianku -1. These include the following 3 examples:
    汝南尹更始翁君本自事千秋。(Hanshu 88)
    我本自疑此。(Jinshu 32)
    眼多本自令渠愛。(Youxianku)

Daigoji manuscript: 本_自り

A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits 1,173 examples, which include the following 2 examples:
    本自誓言。不犯梵行。(Dirghāgama [tr. Buddhayaśas and Zhu Fonian in Hongshi era of Later Qin] 11; T. 1: 67)
    一切諸法性本自空。(Mahāparinirvāṇa-sūtra [tr. Huiyan 慧巖 of Song 宋]; T. 12: 765)

There are 4 examples in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu, which include the following 2 examples:
    如來本自大慈悲、聞語惨地剎雙眉。(Damuqianlian mingqian jiumu bianwen, p. 1035)
    為是真如本自修。(Jingang banruo boluomi jing jiangjing wen 金刚般若波罗蜜经卷文, p. 642)

According to the Gudai hanyu xuci cidian (p. 199), benzi means benzijiu 本自就。Matsuo (1986b) writes that it is synonymous with yuanlai. The kun reading motoyori モトヨリ given in example ① above is apposite.

I-2. Instances in which only combining marks have been added
    1. 亦復 2. 況復（some instances） 3. 獨自
[I-2.1] Yifu 亦復
①至於卓淳，亦復然之。(XIX: 87.18)
   Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunen): 「亦_復」
②卓淳之國，亦復當興。(XIX: 91.10)
   Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunen): 「亦_復」
③愽隨意寶，遂所須用，盡依情，此妙法寶亦復然。(XIX: 101.17)
   Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunen): 「亦_復」
④來到任那，亦復如是。(XIX: 107.9)
   Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunen): 「亦_復」
⑤溝洗之流，亦復凝結。(XXIV: 249.8)
   Iwasaki manuscript, Zushoryō manuscript, Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunen), Kanbun 9 edition: no kunen
⑥奉進，亦復不晚。(XXIV: 257.7)
   Iwasaki manuscript, Zushoryō manuscript, Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunen), Kanbun 9 edition: no kunen
⑦天神地祇，亦復誅罰。(XXVII: 381.10)
   Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunen), Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunen), KanemigI 兼右 manuscript (1540 kunen), Kanbun 9 edition: no kunen
   A search of the Guoxue baodian elicits the following results: Hanshu − 1; Hou Hanshu − 15; Jinshu − 9; Liangshu − 10; Weishu − 6; Suishu − 2; Youxianku − 1. These include the following 3 examples:
   應郡自馬故大堤亦復數重。(Hanshu 29)
   餓死者亦復不少。(Weishu 55)
   圍棋出于智慧，張郎亦復太能。(Youxianku)
   Daigoji manuscript: 「亦_復」
   A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits 22,141 examples, which include the following 2 examples:
   亦復歡喜。思惟分別。(Dirghāgama [tr. Buddhayaśas and Zhu Fonian in Hongshi era of Later Qin] 8; T. 1: 51)
   是諸法者亦復虛偽。(Māyopamasamādhī-sūtra [tr. Zhu Fahu 竹法護 of Western Jin] 2; T. 12: 150)

   There are 15 examples in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu, which include the following 2 examples:
   更一小弟，亦復癡頑。(Shunzi bian 舜子変, p. 203)
   貧道慈親不積善，亡魂亦復落三塗。(Damuqianlian 大目乾連, p. 1028)

   The only examples of kunen in manuscripts of the Nihon shoki are the combining marks used in the Kitano manuscript with kunen from the Nanbokuchō period and the reading is unclear, but they have been provisionally included here in light of the Daigoji manuscript of the Youxianku with kunen from 1344.

[1-2.2] Kuanfu 況復
①況復朝聘既闕，貢職莫脩。(XIV: 481.12)
The Use of Chinese Words of Colloquial origin in the Nihon Shoki

Maeda manuscript: 「況復(去)」 (go) means mata マタ
②況復謀減百濟官 (XIX: 113.17)
  Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunen): 「況復」
③況復平安之世、刀鋒不離於身。(XIX: 123.15)
  Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunen): 「況復」
④斯等雖微、尚謂祥物。況復白雉 (XXV: 313.14)
  Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunen): the character 况 is unclear

The Maeda manuscript takes fu 復 in ① in the sense of “again” (mata マタ), which is inappropriate in this context, but since the Kitano manuscript in ② and ③ uses combining marks, it has been included here.

II. Cases in Which Disyllables Have Not Been Read as One Word

II-1. Instances in which disyllables have not been read as one word and the kunen reading is inappropriate

1. 况復 (some instances)  2. 必自  3. 無復  4. 不復

II-1.2 Bizī 必自

①則曾不血刃、虐必自敗矣。(III: 193.12)
  Atsuta manuscript: no kunen
  Kitano manuscript (kunen by Kanenaga): 「必、自に」
②不意之處、則曾不血刃、恥必自敗矣。(VII: 291.20)
  Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunen): 「必自」
③能祭吾者、則曾不血刃、其國必自服。(VIII: 327.13)
  Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunen): 「必自服」
  Atsuta manuscript: 「必自服」

A search of the Guoxue baodian elicits the following results: Hanshu −3, Hou Hanshu −2; Jinshu −6, Liangshu −0, Weishu −1; Suishu −4, Youxianku −0. These include the following 2 examples:

浮以為天子必自將兵討之。(Hou Hanshu 33)
  知楚之必自來、(Weishu 37)

A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits 142 examples, which include the following 2 examples:

必自如意。(Xiuqing benqi jing 修行本起經 [tr. Zhu Dali 竹大礪 and Kang Mengxiang 康孟祥 of Later Han] 1; T. 3: 466)

狂愚不捨。必自燒身。(Luoyun renru jing 羅云忍辱經 [tr. Faju 法炬 of Western Jin]; T. 14: 769)

There are no examples of bizi in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu.

The word zi 自 is used after monosyllabic adverbs to form disyllabic compounds, and according to the Gudai hanyu xuci cidian the character zi in bizi is a so-called empty word. In the Late Tang there are examples such as shangzi 尚自, xuzi 須自 and yizi 亦自. In the above three examples from the Nihon shoki, bizi is not read as a single word and the kun readings are inappropriate.
[II-1.3] *Wufu* 無復

①天下恆聞、無復晝夜之殊。（I: 115.10）

Kanekata manuscript: 「無復（去）」（去）means *mata* マタ）

②而山中論絕、無復可行之路。（III: 195.19）

Atsuta manuscript: 「無_復…」

③一時殺虜。々無復駕類者。（III: 205.10）

Atsuta manuscript: 「無_復…」

④而猶守迷圖、無復改意。（III: 211.8）

Atsuta manuscript: 「無_復(去)…」

⑤無復風塵。（III: 213.9）

Atsuta manuscript: 「無_復…」

⑥無復可行之路。（VII: 309.14）

Kitano manuscript (Nambokuchô kunten): 「無_復…」

⑦新羅無復侵逼他境。（XIX: 87.7）

Kitano manuscript (Nambokuchô kunten): 「無_復…」

A search of the *Guoxue baodian* elicits the following results: *Hanshu* -10; *Hou Hanshu* −31; *Jinshu* −86; *Liangshu* −18; *Weishu* −40; *Suishu* −28, *Youxianku* −0. These include the following 2 examples:

則君臣分定、無復異心。（*Liangshu* 13）

宴會之時、無復先師之敬。（*Suishu* 9）

A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits 2,797 examples, which include the following 2 examples:

當於爾時。無復日月星辰。（*Dirghâgama* [tr. Buddhayaśas and Zhu Fonian in Hongshi era of Later Qin] 6; T. 1: 37）

無復諸煩惱。(*Piposhifo jing* 毘婆尸佛經 [tr. Fatian 法天] 2; T. 1: 159）

There are 2 examples in the *Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu*:

諸聞已盡、無復煩惱。（*Taizi chengdao jing*, p. 439）

諸聞已盡、無復煩惱。（*Xida taizi xiudao yinyuan* 悉達太子修道因縁 1, p. 473）

According to the *Gudai hanyu xuci cidian*, the character *fu* 復 in *wufu* is an empty word. The *kunten* in the seven examples from the *Nihon shoki* cited above are all inappropriate.

[II-1.4] *Bufu* 不復

①不復別有處所、但臨死氣絕之際、是之謂歿。（I: 95.11）

Kanekata manuscript: 「不_復…」

②由是、長鞠彥軍卒皆迷眩、不復力戰。（III: 209.7）

Kitano manuscript (kunten by Kanenaga): no kunten

③年鋸若干。不復稱夭。（XIV: 499.17）

Maeda and Zushoryô manuscripts: 「不復、稱 - 夭 」

④後由出火之亂、棄而不復檢。（XXVI: 341.9）

Kitano manuscript (Nambokuchô kunten): 「不_復_検」

A search of the *Guoxue baodian* elicits the following results: *Hanshu* −43; *Hou Hanshu* −49; *Jinshu* −141; *Liangshu* −32; *Weishu* −74; *Suishu* −39, *Youxianku* −0. These include the
following 2 examples:

設壇而拜、不復考試。(Hou Hanshu 27)

玉樹後庭花，花開不復久。（Suishu 22）

A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits 7,326 examples, which include the following 2 examples:

反覆諳觀、不復屈伸。（Dirghāgama [tr. Buddhayaśas and Zhu Fonian in Hongshi era of Later Qin] 7; T. 1: 45）

現身財寶不復貧難。（Sūrataparīṣṭhā [tr. Bai Yan 白延 of Cao-Wei 曹魏]; T. 12: 56）

There are 4 examples in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu, which include the following 2 examples:

更不復坐苦。（Lushan Yuangong hua, p. 268）

不復煩惱國家財寶、(Xudana taizi haoshi yinyuan 須大拏太子好施因緣, p. 502）

Since fu in bufu is an empty word, the kunten in examples ①, ③ and ④ above are inappropiate.

II-2. Instances in which disyllables have not been read as one word but the sense is not all that wide of the mark or else unclear

1 應時 2 何當 3 皆悉 4 好復 5 各自 6 偉皆 7 共同 8 極甚
9 更亦 10 更不 11 更無 12 勿復 13 再三 (一部) 15 最為
16 事須 17 芗甚 18 悉皆 19 實是 20 時復 21 正在 22 即自
23 即時 大有
24 矛爾 25 不都 26 都無 27 當须 28 倍復
29 必應 30 必須 31 必當 32 並悉 33 並不
34 並是 34 便即

[II-2.18] Xijie 悉皆

①天見屋命・太玉命、及諸部神等、悉皆相授。（II: 153.20）

Kanbun 9 edition: 「悉皆」

②下及百姓、悉皆饒富、令無所乏。（XX: 145.14）

Maeda manuscript: 「悉(ヲ)に皆」

③悉皆隨侍。使人賜鞍作臣屍於大臣貔夷。（XXIV: 265.9）

Iwasaki manuscript: 「悉(ヲ)に皆」

①天皇、及臣連等、所有品部、宜悉皆罷、為國家民。（XXV: 299.15）

Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunten): 「悉(ヲ)に皆」

A search of the Guoxue baodian elicits the following results: Hanshu — 0, Hou Hanshu — 2; Jinshu — 5; Liangshu — 8; Weishu — 12; Suishu — 1; Youxianku — 0. These include the following 2 examples:

于是西域五十余國悉皆頒賞內屬焉。（Hou Hanshu 47）

自是湘部諸郡、悉皆蜂起。（Liangshu 19）

A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits 7,591 examples, which include the following 2 examples:

3 This has been included here because it was taken up by Matsuo (1986b), but it should probably not be regarded as a disyllable.
There are 15 examples in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu, which include the following 2 examples:

應是山潤鬼神，悉皆到來。*(Lushan Yuangong hua, p. 253)*

身肉悉皆充供養，經過千劫不為難。*(Foshuo Amituo jing jiangjing wen 佛說阿彌陀經押座文, p. 1160)*

The word *xijie* is an adverb expressing extent and means “all”. The *Gudai hanyu xuci cidian* defines it as a compound empty word. The two elements *xi* and *jie* formed a disyllabic compound that came into use in the Six Dynasties period but it is no longer used in contemporary Chinese. In examples ①-④ above, the *kun* reading *kotogotoku ni mina* 悉(者)に皆 does not take it as a disyllable, but the sense is nonetheless not all that wide of the mark.

**[II-2.19] Shishi 實是**

①方知、實是皇孫之胤。*(II: 163.10)*

**Kanekata manuscript:** 「實に是(者)に」

②從地來者、當有地垢。實是妙美之。*(II: 171.8)*

**Kanekata manuscript:** 「実に是(者)に」

A search of the Guoxue baodian elicits the following results: *Hanshu* 0, *Hou Hanshu* 0, *Jinshu* 0, *WeiShu* 0, *Suishu* 1, *Youxianku* 1. These include the following 3 examples:

先奴後己，實是宿心。*(Jinshu 180)*

沉鱗競躍，實是欲界之仙都。*(Yiwen leiju 37)*

真成物外奇希物，實是人間斷絕人。*(Youxianku)*

**Daigoji manuscript:** 「實に是(者)に」

A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits 1,516 examples, which include the following 2 examples:

此實是毀謗言也。*(Dīrghāgama [tr. Buddhayaśas and Zhu Fonian in Hongshi era of Later Qin] 16; T. 1: 102)*

雖現女身實是菩薩。*(Mahāparinirvāṇa-sūtra [tr. Huiyan of Song] 1; T. 12: 606)*

There are 22 examples in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu, which include the following 2 examples:

當今日下，實是孤危。*(Li Ling bianwen, p. 130)*

東鄰美女，實是不如。*(Pomo bian 破魔變, p. 534)*

According to Shimura (1984), in the early medieval period there was a rapid increase in words ending in *shi* 是, and in the *Youxianku* there appear words such as *zhishi* 是是, *zhongshi* 終是, *shishi* 實是, *jishi* 既是, *naishi* 乃是, *jishi* 即是 and *dingshi* 定是. The adverbial usage of ～*shi* is prevalent in works by Du Fu 杜甫. In the Late Tang and Five Dynasties period the tendency to use *shi* as a suffix is said to have progressed even further.

**[II-2.31] Bidang 必當**

①此云字氣譬能美善箇。必當生子。*(I: 105.15)*

**Kanekata and Kanenatsu 兼夏 manuscripts (late Kamakura kunten): no kunten**
Kanbun 9 edition: 「必 當 …」

② 必當奪我天原、乃設大夫武備。(I: 107.14)
Kanekata manuscript (late Kamakura kunten): 「必、當」

③ 不有凌奪之意者、汝所生兒、必當男矣 (I: 107.17)
Kanekata manuscript (late Kamakura kunten): 「必、當」

④ 必當為女。如此則可以降女於莘原中國。(I: 107.17)
Kanekata manuscript (late Kamakura kunten): 「必、當」

⑤ 有清心者、必當生男矣 (I: 119.20)
Kanekata manuscript (late Kamakura kunten): 「必、當」

⑥ 防禦者、國內諸神、必當同禦。(II: 141.8)
Kanekata manuscript (late Kamakura kunten): 「必、當」

⑦ 指若用此矛治國者、必當平安。(II: 141.9)
Kanekata manuscript (late Kamakura kunten): 「必、當 - 平 - 安」

⑧ 誓之曰、妾所娠、若非天孫之胤、必當焦滅。(II: 143.9)
Kanekata manuscript (late Kamakura kunten): 「必、焦_滅」

⑨ 若以惡心射者、則天稚彦、必當遭害。(II: 145.7)
Kanekata manuscript (late Kamakura kunten): 「必 當 害」

⑩ 是實天孫之子者、必當全生、則入其室中、以火焚室。(II: 155.20)
Kanekata manuscript (late Kamakura kunten): 「必_當」

① 余謂、彼地、必當足以恢弘大業、(III: 189.17)
Kitano manuscript (kunten by Kanenaga): 「必、足 當」

② 若能敬祭我者、必當自平矣。(V: 239.17)
Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunten): 「必 當 …」

③ 必當戮辱、遍於臣連、酷毒流於民庶。(XIV: 501.8)
Maeda manuscript: 「必當」

④ 必當遵教、宜速報王。(XIX: 97.9)
Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunten): no kunten
Kanbun 9 edition: 「必 …」

⑤ 今不遠而復、必當有敬 (XIX: 103.13)
Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunten): 「復 必…」

⑥ 往救將亡之主、必當國家 (XIX: 115.16)
Kitano manuscript (Nanbokuchō kunten): 「必當」

⑦ 十一月、明察功過、賞罰必當。(XXII: 185.10)
Iwasaki manuscript: 「必當」
Zushoryō manuscript: 「必當」

⑧ 未詔之間、必當難待。(XXV: 303.10)
Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunten): 「必當」

⑨ 方今不伐新羅、於後必當有悔。(XXV: 317.19)
Kitano manuscript (early Kamakura kunten): 「必當」

Among the above 19 examples, there are none in which bidang is read as one word.

A search of the Guoxue baodian elicits the following results: Hanshu −0, Hou Hanshu −12; Jinshu −20; Liangshu −8; Weishu −20; Suishu −12; Youxianku −0. These include the
following 3 examples:
今若立之，後必當怨。(Hou Hanshu 10b)
玄冬之初，必當開爽。(Weishu 53)
此輩惜妻子，必當死戰。(Suishu 55)

A search of the CBETA Electronic Tripitaka elicits 1,736 examples, which include the following 2 examples:
有來求必當施與。(Mahāprajāpāramitā-sūtra [tr. Xuanzang] 533; T. 7: 722)
必當捨離一切繫縛。(Avatāṃsaka-sūtra [tr. Śikṣānanda] 19; T. 10: 103)

There are 6 examples in the Dunhuang bianwen jiaozhu, which include the following 2 examples:
屋無強梁、必當顚覆;(Wu Zixu bianwen, p. 16)
龍天歡喜、必當罪滅三世。(Taizi chengdao jing, p. 463)

Liu Qi 劉淇 (zhùi bianlüè 助字辨略) defines bi 必 as shen ye 審也 (p. 248), while deng 當 is synonymous with ying 應. According to Zhang Yongyan 張永言 (Shishuo xinyu 世說新語, p. 19), on the other hand, dang has no real meaning. Matsuo (1986b), meanwhile, explains that bidang expresses the conjecture that something will occur “without doubt”.

3. Concluding Remarks

In the above we have considered 54 disyllabic adverbs used in the Nihon shoki, and it has been found that 11 of these, representing about twenty percent, were read as single words. There were also 4 disyllables that were not read as single words and for which inappropriate kun readings were given, and this also represents about seven percent. In the majority of cases, these disyllabic adverbs were not interpreted as single words, but the sense in which they were read was either not all that wide of the mark or else unclear. The Japanese method of reading Chinese was based on the grammar of classical Chinese, which is primarily monosyllabic, and so there developed a method of readings Chinese that was close to the diction of Chinese in respect to both writing conventions and grammar. But with the increase in disyllabic words, the Japanese failed to develop a method of readings Chinese that reflected colloquial usage. Considered as a whole, the kunten applied to the Nihon shoki shows lack of understanding of colloquial Chinese, and the gulf between Chinese and Japanese usage has not been bridged, but it could be said that there are no major errors in the interpretation of the general sense of the words in question. (Readings based on the Wenxuan so-called Monzen-yomi are not used in the kunten applied to the Nihon shoki.)

It is thought that finding Japanese readings for Chinese words of colloquial origin would have entailed considerable difficulties, and there are instances in which inappropriate kun readings were used. Probable reasons for this were (1) a lack of understanding of colloquial Chinese (although this varied with the period and also school of learning) and (2) the fact that Japanese readings for Chinese characters had become fixed. This could be described as the fate or limitation of study centered on the classical language.
Source Materials


—. n. d. (draft). *Maeda-bon Nihon shoki Inseiki ten sōsakuin* 前田本日本書紀院政期点総索引 (General index to the Maeda manuscript of the *Nihon shoki* with kunten from the Inseki period).

—. 1980. *Zushoryō-bon Nihon shoki Inseiki ten (honmon hen)* 図書館旧日本書紀院政期点 (本文篇) (Zushoryō manuscript of the *Nihon shoki* with kunten from the Inseki period [text]). Miki Shuppansha 美季出版社.

—. 1981. *Zushoryō-bon Nihon shoki Inseiki ten (sakui ten)* 図書館旧日本書紀院政期点 (索引篇) (Zushoryō manuscript of the *Nihon shoki* with kunten from the Inseki period [index]). Miki Shuppansha.

—. n. d. (draft). *Kitano-bon Nihon shoki (honmon hen)* 北野本日本書紀 (本文篇) (Kitano manuscript of *Nihon shoki* [text]).

—. n. d. (draft). *Kanekata-bon Nihon shoki (honmon hen)* 兼方本日本書紀 (本文篇) (Kanekata manuscript of *Nihon shoki* [text]).

—. n. d. (draft). *Kanekata-bon Nihon shoki (sakui ten)* 兼方本日本書紀 (索引篇) (Kanekata manuscript of *Nihon shoki* [index]).


Daigoji 長岡寺 manuscript of *Youxianku* 遊仙窟. Koten Hozonkai 古典保存会. 1927.

Shinpukuji 真福寺 manuscript of *Youxianku*. Kichō Kotenseki Kankōkai 貴重古典資料刊行会. 1954.


Selected References


—. 1986. “Iwasaki-bon Nihon shoki shoten no gōfu ni mirareru tango ishiki” 岩崎日本書紀初点の合符に見られる単語意識 (The Awareness of words to be seen in combinig marks in early kunten in the Iwasaki manuscript of the *Nihon shoki*). In *Tsukishima Hiroshi hakushi kaureki kinen kokugogaku ronshū* 篠島裕博士還暦記念国語学論集 (Collected essays on Japanese linguistics in commemoration of the 60th birthday of Dr. Tsukishima Hiroshi). Meiji Shoin 明治書院.


—. 1988. “'Kandai yakkyō to kōgo' — yakkyō ni yoru kōgoshi, shotan —” 「漢代訳經と口語」—訳経による
口語史・初探—— (“The translation of Buddhist scriptures during the Han period and colloquialisms”: An initial inquiry into the history of the colloquial language on the basis of translated scriptures).  *Wakan Hikaku Bungaku* 5.

——. 1991. “’Kunten shiryō o yomu’—— butten no kōgo hyōgen o chūshin ni”「訓点資料を読む」——仏典の口語表現を中心に—— (Reading kunten materials: With a focus on colloquial expressions in Buddhist texts).  *Josetsu Nara Joshi Daigaku* 叙説奈良女子大学 18.
