

HOKKAIDO UNIVERSITY

Title	Catalytic activities of titania-supported nickel for carbon-dioxide methanation					
Author(s)	Unwiset, Preeya; Chanapattharapol, Kingkaew Chayakul; Kidkhunthod, Pinit; Poo-arporn, Yingyot; Ohtani, Bunsho					
Citation	Chemical Engineering Science, 228, 115955 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ces.2020.115955					
Issue Date	2020-12-31					
Doc URL	http://hdl.handle.net/2115/87838					
Rights	© 2020. This manuscript version is made available under the CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 license http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/					
Rights(URL)	http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/					
Туре	article (author version)					
File Information	Ni-PREEY_011f.pdf					



1	Catalytic activities of titania-supported nickel for carbon-dioxide
2	methanation
3	Preeya Unwiset ^a , Kingkaew Chayakul Chanapattharapol ^{a*} ,
4	Pinit Kidkhunthod ^b , Yingyot Poo-arporn ^b , Bunsho Ohtani ^c
5	^a Materials Chemistry Research Center, Department of Chemistry and Center of Excellence for Innovation in
6	Chemistry, Faculty of science, Khon Kaen University, Khon Kaen, 40002, Thailand
7 8	^b Synchrotron Light Research Institute, 111 University Avenue, Muang District, Nakhon Ratchasima, 30000, Thailand
9	°Institute for Catalysis, Hokkaido University, Sapporo 001-0021, Japan
10	
11	*Corresponding author. Tel: +66 430 09700 ext. 12371, Fax: +66 432 02373.
12	E-mail address: kingkaew@kku.ac.th (K.C. Chanapattharapol).
13	
14	
15	Ittania (IIO ₂)-supported nickel (Ni) catalysts (3, 6, 12 and 20wt%; Ni/IiO ₂) were
16	prepared by a sol-gel method to be used as a catalyst for carbon-dioxide (CO_2) methanation.
17	The catalytic activity tests were conducted with a fixed-bed reactor in the temperature range of
18	100–550 °C. The results showed that the CO_2 conversion increased with increasing Ni content
19	and 20wt% Ni/TiO ₂ exhibited the highest CO ₂ conversion and the methane (CH ₄) yield which
20	corresponded to the lowest apparent activation energy. Moreover, $20wt\% Ni/TiO_2$ also showed
21	high stability under the CO_2 methanation stream for 72 h. The addition of Ni into TiO_2 during
22	the sol-gel process modified the catalyst properties which affected to their catalytic activities,
23	and the influence of Ni addition on the catalyst structure was studied by several techniques.
24	The results on XRD and EXAFS revealed unit cell expansion and lattice distortion which
25	indicated that nickel(II) cation was incorporated into TiO2 lattice. Upon increasing in Ni
26	content, the nickel(II) oxide (NiO) phase was observed indicating the high crystallinity of NiO
27	and suppression of TiO_2 crystal growth. These effects led to smaller crystalline size of TiO_2
28	and higher surface area of the catalysts. The oxidation states of nickel and titanium were
29	analyzed to be +2 and +4, respectively for fresh catalysts. After pretreatment by hydrogen
30	(H ₂), Ni(II) was converted to Ni(0) and this electronic state was still unchanged during the
31	course of methanation while Ti(IV) was kept unaltered for fresh catalysts and those during the
32	reaction. However, the distortion or defect around Ti(IV) ions in Ni-loaded TiO2 was observed
33	as increase in Ti K-edge XANES pre-edge peaks. The addition of Ni led to formation of
34	oxygen vacancy in TiO_2 lattice and NiO-phase formation which might act as the sites for CO_2

and H₂ adsorption, respectively. Therefore, higher amount of adsorbed CO₂ and H₂ could
 enhance the surface reaction and also speed up the CO₂-methanation.

37 Keywords: carbon-dioxide methanation; titania-supported nickel; XANES; EXAFS

38 39

1. Introduction

40 Recently, global warming is the most concerned problem of the world. The main reason for this problem is releasing high level of greenhouse gases (GHG) into the atmosphere. 41 Carbon dioxide (CO₂) has a large proportion of GHG. Enormous CO₂ emission level is a 42 43 mainly result from human activities such as burning fossil fuel (coal, natural gas, and oil), transportation, deforestation, agriculture, electricity and industrial sectors. Therefore, reduction 44 and utillization of CO₂ to produce value-added raw meterials for chemical reactions are 45 intersted. CO₂ methanation is one of a powerful approach to utillize the CO₂ as a feedstock for 46 producing CH₄. This reaction is called the Sabatier reaction which is defied as the following 47 48 equation;

$$CO_2 + 4H_2 \longrightarrow CH_4 + 2H_2O \qquad \Delta H_{298K} = -165 \text{ kJ mol}^{-1}$$
(1)

The characteristic of this reaction are as follows; i) this reaction is a highly exothermic process, 50 thus, CH₄ formation prefers to occur at low temperature and high pressure [1,2] ii) there is a 51 kinetic barrier with eight-electron reduction process of the CO_2 (4+) to form CH_4 (4-) iii) CO_2 52 53 molecule is a strong linear structure with two double bond, so high dissociation energy must be consumed and iv) side reaction, reverse water gas shift ($CO_2 + 4H_2 \longrightarrow CO + 2H_2O$) [3], 54 55 occurs usually at high temperature which can produce an undesired product (CO). Therefore, from these limitations of this reaction, to increase the rate at low temperature, the catalyst must 56 be employed. 57

Normally, the catalyst is consisted of two components; support and active component. 58 59 The typical support properties are chemical stability, high thermal resistance and high surface 60 area and porosity. The last properties have a significant role in catalytic reaction, since the adsorption and surface reaction processes are occurred on catalyst surface. An active 61 component is another important component which is usually added onto the support with a 62 small amount when compared with support. The function of an active site is selectively toward 63 on adsorption of reactants, thus, an appropriate selectively active component is used for 64 enhancing the adsorption and also speed-up the surface reaction. Consequently, tuning and 65 modifying these two components properties can control and dominate the catalytic 66 performance of the catalyst. For CO₂ methanation, enhancing the adsorption ability of two 67

reactants (CO₂ and H₂) on catalyst surface can possibly improve the surface reaction between 68 these two absorbed species and then the product formation rate also increases. Therefore, 69 modifying catalyst with appropriate active site for CO₂ and H₂ adsorption can enhance the 70 reaction rate. It is well known that H₂ favors to adsorb on metal, especially transition metal 71 group, various active metals are widely used for this reaction such as Rh, Ru, Pt and Pd [4-7]. 72 73 However, using the noble metals are limited due to their high cost and scarcity [8]. From this reason, nickel is more attractive to be used for CO₂ methanation due to its relatively low price 74 and also give high activity [9-11]. In order to enhance the H₂ adsorption capacity, high 75 76 dispersion of active metal on catalyst surface must be done. However, Ni can be deactivated 77 by using at high temperature due to sintering process, thus, modifying the catalyst with resistance of this effect is also of interested. For CO₂ adsorption, providing the basic sites on 78 catalyst surface can improve the CO₂ uptake via acid-base interaction. For this aspect, addition 79 of basic metal oxide such as La₂O₃, CeO₂ and MgO is usually employed. Other method to 80 81 increase CO₂ uptake is to produce an oxygen vacancy which is reported as an adsorption site for CO₂ molecule [12,13]. Oxygen vacancy can be formed within the metal oxide support by 82 83 substitution of the host metal by adding metal with lower oxidation state than that of host metal [14,15]. Formation of oxygen vacancy by this way is usually used with a reducible support 84 85 (TiO₂, CeO₂, ZrO₂, etc.), since the oxygen vacancy can mobile inside the lattice and plays an important role in redox process. Finally, it is seen that tuning and modifying of catalyst 86 properties by considering the characteristic of reaction can produce the catalyst with great 87 catalytic performance. It is reported that the synthesis method is strongly determined the 88 89 physical and chemical properties of catalyst [11,16]. Many synthesis methods were reported to be used and provided a great catalytic performance [6,17,18]. However, the simple, 90 environment friendly and inexpensive processes were usually preferred. The sol-gel method is 91 one of the simplest and the most widely used due to its low cost of the required instrument, 92 93 mild synthesis condition and also providing high homogeneous of the catalyst.

In this work, Ni was selected to be used as an active metal and TiO₂ was a support. 94 Since using TiO₂ as a catalyst support for CO₂ methanation is still developed, thus it is 95 challenging to modify TiO₂ catalysts which provide the excellent activity and produce the 96 97 desired products for this reaction. Sol-gel method was used as a synthesis method to produce Ni/TiO₂ catalysts with different Ni loading. The structural and surface properties of synthesized 98 samples upon addition of Ni was investigated by X-ray diffraction (XRD), N₂ adsorption-99 desorption, transmission electron microscopy (TEM), H₂ temperature-programmed reduction 100 (TPR), H₂ chemisorption and thermogravimetric analysis. All strategies were used for studying 101

the effect of Ni addition for CO₂ methanation. Advanced analysis of local structures and
oxidation sates of probe metals (Ni and Ti) was determined by using X-ray absorption
spectroscopy (XAS) which was including with X-ray absorption near-edge structure (XANES)
and extended X-ray-absorption fine structure (EXAFS). The effect of Ni addition to enhance
the CO₂ methanation was discussed based on the all characterized results.

107

108 **2. Experimental**

109

2.1 Syntheses of TiO₂ and Ni-loaded TiO₂ catalysts

All synthesized samples were prepared by sol-gel method using titanium(IV) isopropoxide (98%, Acros Organics) as a precursor. For pure TiO₂, Ti precursor was mixed with glacial acetic acid (RCI Labscan) and 2-propanol (Carlo Erba Reagents) and then stirred for 30 min. The mixture was dropped wise with deionized water (DI) and vigorously stirred for starting hydrolysis reaction. Finally, the solution was dried in an oven at 110°C for 24 h and calcined at 500°C for 2 h to obtain bare TiO₂.

In preparation of Nickle (Ni) modified TiO_2 catalysts, the titanium(IV) isopropoxide, glacial acetic acid and 2-propanol were mixed with the same manners as the above-mentioned pure-TiO₂ preparation. The desired amount of nickel nitrate (Carlo Erba Reagents) was dissolved with DI water and then dropped wise in the Ti precursor mixture. The solution was dried and calcined at the same conditions as pure TiO₂. The synthesized samples were denoted as *X*wt% Ni/TiO₂ where *X* = 3, 6, 12 and 20wt%.

122

129

2.2 Characterization

123 The structural properties of synthesized samples were characterized by X-ray 124 diffraction (XRD) using Rigaku SmartLab X-ray diffractometer using Cu K_{α} ($\lambda = 0.154$ nm). 125 The XRD pattern was collected in the 2 θ range of 10° to 80°. Bragg's equation was used to 126 determine the unit cell parameters of samples by using (101) crystallographic plane of anatase 127 TiO₂. The means of crystallite sizes of TiO₂ and Ni-loaded TiO₂ were calculated by the 128 Scherer's equation:

 $D = \frac{K\lambda}{\beta\cos\theta} \tag{2}$

130 where *D* is the crystallite size, *K* is the shape factor, λ is the X-ray wavelength, β is the 131 broadening at half maximum and θ is the diffraction angle. In order to determine the strain 132 induced by addition of Ni, the Williamson-Hall (W-H) plot method was used which can be 133 expressed by the following equation;

$$\beta\cos\theta = \frac{K\lambda}{D} + 4\varepsilon\sin\theta \tag{3}$$

- where ε is the strain induced from crystal imperfection and distortion. The W-H plot shows a relationship between $\beta \cos \theta$ and $4\sin \theta$. The strain (ε) can be estimated from the slope of linear fit and the crystallite size (*D*) can also be determined from y-intercept.
- Nitrogen (N₂) adsorption-desorption isotherms were recorded using a 138 Quantachrome (previously Yuasa Ionics; Autosorb 6AG) surface-area and pore-size analyzer. 139 Prior N₂ adsorption, the sample was degassed at 200 °C for 2 h to remove the moisture on 140 surface sample. Specific surface area, average pore size and pore volume were calculated by 141 Brunnauer-Emmett-Teller (BET) equation. The specific surface area was commonly 142 determined at relative pressure (P/P_0) range between 0.1 to 0.3. Barrett-Joyner-Halenda (BJH) 143 144 method was used to calculate the pore size distribution. The pore volume was measured at the relative pressure closed to unity $(P/P_0 \sim 1)$. 145
- Hydrogen (H₂) temperature-programmed reduction (TPR) was investigated by a Belcat B apparatus. A 20-mg portion of sample was pretreated by flowing with helium (He) at 120 °C for 30 min to clean up the surface. After cooling down, the mixture gases of H₂ and argon (Ar) were flowed over the sample while the temperature was rose up to 1000 °C with ramping rate of 10 K min⁻¹. Thermal conductivity detector (TCD) was used to collect the change of thermal conductivity of the gas stream. H₂ consumption was plotted as a function of temperature.
- Transmission electron microscopy were performed by TEM, a FEI Tecnai G2 20 S-TWIN), to analyze particles sizes and morphologies of samples. The catalyst particles were dispersed in ethanol by sonication before dropping on copper grids.
- Inductively coupled plasma-optical emission spectroscopy (ICP-OES) analysis was employed to measure the Ni contents. The powder (0.025 g) of sample was digested by a mixture of concentrated H_2SO_4 (6 mL) and 30% H_2O_2 (2 mL). The calibration curve was in the range of 0-30 ppm. An Optima 100 DVICO-OES (PerkinElmer) instrument was used to analyze Ni contents in a sample solution. The plasma was generated by an RF power with 1300W, and plasma flow rate was 15 L/min. Auxillary and neubilizer flow rate was 0.2 L/min and 0.8 L/min, respectively. Emission light signal was detected by a CCD-array detector.
- 163

2.3 H₂ chemisorption and CO₂ uptake

H₂ chemisorption experiment was used to investigate the metal active sites on the
 catalyst surface which play an important role in enhancing the reaction rate. The H₂

chemisorbed amount of all-loaded samples (3, 6, 12 and 20wt% Ni/TiO₂) was carried out by 166 Quantachrome Autosorb-1-C instrument. 200 mg of catalyst was first pretreated by flowing 167 with He at 120 °C (ramp rate 20 °C min⁻¹) for 30 min. After pretreatment, H₂ (99.999%, Thai 168 Industrial Gas) was flowed over the sample during rising the temperature up to 300 °C (ramp 169 rate 20 °C min⁻¹) and the temperature was kept constant at this point for 120 min. Next, the 170 171 sample was cooled down to 40 °C under vacuum and then H₂ was sequentially added to the sample. The amount of H₂ chemisorption was obtained by extrapolating method of the graph 172 between volume of H₂ uptake and pressure. The monolayer of H₂ uptake ($N_{\rm m}$; µmol g⁻¹) can be 173 calculated by the following equation; 174

175

$$N_{\rm m} = 44.61 \ V_{\rm m}$$
 (4)

where $V_{\rm m}$ is the volume of monolayer uptake which can be determined by extrapolating method. 176 CO₂ adsorption capacity of sample can be also used to explain the role of catalyst to catalyze 177 the reaction rate. The CO₂ uptake was monitored by thermalgravimetric analysis (TGA, Pyris 178 Diamond, Perkin Elmer Instrument). Al₂O₃ was used as a reference. First, the synthesized 179 180 sample was separately weighted and put on the aluminum pan and then placed on the sample holder. The maximum different weight between sample and reference was 0.5 mg. The sample 181 was first pretreated by heating at 150 °C (10 °C min⁻¹) for 45 min under N₂ flowing to remove 182 an impurities. After that, CO₂ uptake was started by cooling down the sample to 40 °C under 183 CO_2 flowing (100 mL min⁻¹) for 60 min. Upon decreasing the temperature, the weight of sample 184 was increased due to adsorption of CO₂ on solid surface. The CO₂ uptake can be calculated by 185 differentiate the weight before and after adsorption. 186

187

2.4 CO₂ methanation catalytic activity test

The CO₂ methanation-activity test was carried out in a fixed bed reactor with inner 188 189 diameter of 0.6 mm. 50 mg of sample was placed at middle of pyrex reactor tube and sandwiched with quartz wool. Accurate temperature was monitored by K-type thermocouple 190 which was located on the top of catalyst bed. The flow rates of the reactant gases were precisely 191 controlled by mass flow controllers. Prior activity test, the synthesized catalyst was reduced 192 under H₂ flow (50 mL min⁻¹) at 450°C and maintained for 90 min. After that, the system was 193 cooled down to 150°C to start the reaction. H₂ and CO₂ was used as a feed gas with a ratio of 194 $H_2/CO_2 = 4$ (balance with He). Total flow rate of feed gas was 40 mL min⁻¹ and GHSV was 195 48,000 mL g⁻¹ min⁻¹. The reaction temperatures were in the range of 100-550 °C. The effluent 196 products and remaining reactants were analyzed by an online gas chromatography (Agilent 197

6890N Series, Agilent Technology) equipped with HEYSEP D Packed Column and TCD
detector. Instrumental diagram of CO₂ methanation catalytic activity test set up is shown in
Figure 1. CO₂ conversion, CH₄ and CO selectivity and yield were calculated by the following
equations:

$$X_{\rm CO_2} = \left(\frac{F_{\rm CO_{2in}} - F_{\rm CO_{2out}}}{F_{\rm CO_{2in}}}\right) \times 100 \tag{5}$$

(6)

(7)

$$S_{\text{CH}_4, \text{ CO}} = \left(\frac{F_{\text{CH}_{4_{\text{out}}}} \text{ CO}_{\text{out}}}{F_{\text{CH}_{4_{\text{out}}}} + F_{\text{CO}_{\text{out}}}}\right) \times 100$$

204
$$Y_{\text{CH}_4, \text{ CO}} = \left(\frac{X_{\text{CO}_2} \times S_{\text{CH}_4, \text{ CO}}}{100}\right)$$

202

210

where, X_{CO_2} is the CO₂ conversion, S is the selectivity and Y is the yield. F is the molar flow rate of gas (mol s⁻¹).

The rate of CO_2 methanation were measured in the temperature range of 240-290 °C to keep below 10% of CO_2 conversion. The rate of reaction was calculated using the following equation [19];

$$Rate = \left(\frac{F_{CO_2}}{W}\right) \times X_{CO_2}$$
(8)

211 where, F_{CO_2} is the flow rate of CO₂ (mol s⁻¹), W represents the weight of catalyst (g).



Figure 1 Instrumental diagram of CO₂ methanation catalytic activity test.

214 2.5 X-ray Absorption Spectroscopy (XAS)

215

2.5.1 X-ray Absorption Near Edge Structure (XANES)

X-ray Absorption Near Edge Structure (XANES) experiment was divided into 216 two parts; ex-situ and in-situ XANES experiments. The ex-situ XANES experiment was 217 conducted to investigate the oxidation state of Ni and Ti on the fresh catalysts. While in-situ 218 experiment was used to monitor the electronic state changing of Ni and Ti during CO₂ 219 methanation. The ex-situ XANES experiment was carried out on beamline 5.2 at Synchrotron 220 Light Research Institute (SLRI), Nakhon Ratchasima, Thailand [20,21]. The Ge (220) was used 221 as double crystal monochromator with energy resolution of 2×10^{-4} eV. The in-situ XANES 222 experiment was carried out on beamline 2.2 at Synchrotron Light Research Institute (SLRI), 223 Nakhon Ratchasima, Thailand. The Si (111) crystal was used as an Energy Dispersive 224 Monochromator (EDM) which covered photons energy of 2400-12000 eV. The linear image 225 sensor was a detector. Samples were prepared by mixing with Boron Nitride (BN) to a 226 homogeneous powder by using ball milling for 20 minutes. After that, the mixed solid sample 227

was compressed to a pellet. For ex-situ XANES experiment the pellet was placed on a Kapton 228 tape which was stuck on the sample frame. The XANES spectra were collected in the K 229 absorption edge energy for both Ni and Ti in transition mode. The ionization chamber was 230 employed as a detector which was located in front of and behind the sample. For in-situ 231 XANES experiment, the prepared sample in pellet form was placed in an in-situ cell. The in-232 situ XANES experiment condition was almost the same as CO₂ methanation catalytic activity 233 test. The sample was pretreated with H_2 (24 mL min⁻¹) during the temperature rose up from 234 room temperature to 450 °C (heating rate of 5 °C min⁻¹) and the XAS data were collected for 235 each 10 °C increment. The reduction temperature (450 °C) was held for 1.5 h and the data was 236 also recorded every 10 minutes. After pretreatment, the system was cooled down to 150 °C 237 while the mixed feed gas between CO_2 (6 mL min⁻¹) and H_2 (24 mL min⁻¹) were purged through 238 the sample to start the CO₂ methanation. At the starting state (150 °C), the reaction temperature 239 was raised with the rate of 5 °C min⁻¹ to 200 °C and the data was recorded every 10 °C 240 increment. Then, the temperature was kept constant at 200 °C for 20 minutes with recording of 241 the data for every 10 minutes. The experiment was continuously conducted with the same 242 procedure as above; i.e. the reaction temperature was also increased for each 50 °C with the 243 heating rate of 5 °C min⁻¹ (recording data for each 10 °C increment) and held at that temperature 244 for 20 minutes (recoding data for each 10 minutes). The reaction temperature of an in-situ 245 246 experiment was in the range of 150-550 °C. Figure 2 shows the schematic of in-situ experiment for XANES. 247



248 **Figure 2** Schematic of in-situ experiment for XANES.

249

2.5.2 Extended X-ray Absorption Fine Structure (EXAFS)

Extended X-ray Absorption Fine Structure (EXAFS) was carried out to 250 determine the coordination number, interatomic distance and structural and thermal disorder 251 252 around Ni probe. The EXAFS was used to monitor the electronic state changing of Ni during CO₂ methanation. The experiment was done on Beamline 5.2 at the Synchrotron Light 253 Research Institute (SLRI). (electron energy of 1.2 GeV; bending magnet; beam current 80-150 254 mA; 1.1 to 1.7 x 10¹¹ photon s⁻¹). The Ni K-edge experiment was collected in transmission 255 mode (8333 eV). The X-ray incident and transmitted beam intensities were detected by 256 257 ionization chamber which was placed in front of and behind the sample. Samples were mixed 258 with Boron Nitride (BN) to form a homogeneous powder and compressed to a pellet. The sample was pretreatment under H₂ flowing at 450 °C (20 mL min⁻¹). The pretreatment 259 temperature was hold at this point for 90 min and the data were collected during this state. 260 Afterwards, the system was cooled down to 100 °C and CO₂ was purged at 5 mL min⁻¹ to start 261 the reaction. In each step, the reaction temperature was increased for each 50 °C and kept 262 constant for 30 min with collecting the EXAFS spectra. The experiment was continuously run 263 by increasing reaction temperature from 100 to 550 °C. 264

265 The fine structure of EXAFS region is expressed in terms; $\chi(E)=\mu(E)$ -266 $\mu_0(E)/\Delta\mu_0(E)$, where $\mu(E)$ is the absorption coefficient, $\mu_0(E)$ is the smooth background function and $\Delta\mu_0$ is the absorption edge. The wave behavior of photoelectron (k) can be written by X-ray energy as; $k = \sqrt{2m_e(E-E_0)/h^2}$, where E_0 is the absorption edge energy and m_e is the electron mass. The oscillation in $\chi(k)$ model of EXAFS region is corresponding to

270
$$\chi(k) = \sum_{j} \frac{N_{j} S_{0}^{2} f_{j}(k) e^{-2R_{j}^{2} \lambda} e^{-2k^{2} \sigma_{j}^{2}}}{kR_{j}^{2}} \sin[2kR_{j} + \delta_{j}(k)]$$
(9)

where N_j is the number of neighboring atoms, R_j is the neighboring distance and σ_j^2 is the disorder of neighboring distance. F(k) and $\delta(k)$ are the scattering-amplitude and phase-shift. S₀² is the amplitude reduction factor. The data is usually expressed by Fourier transformation from $\chi(k)$ to R space to study local structure around neighboring atom as

275
$$\chi(\mathbf{R}) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \int_{k_{\min}}^{k_{\max}} k^n \chi(\mathbf{k}) \mathbf{W}(\mathbf{k}) e^{i2\mathbf{k}\mathbf{R}} d\mathbf{k}$$
(10)

The next step is normalization of the experiment data by ATHENA program. The spectra were amplified by k^2 weight with window in R space range of 1-5 Å and k range of 3-10 Å⁻¹. To determine the local structure of Ni-loaded TiO₂ in CO₂ methanation, Ni foil was used as a model fitting of EXAFS data. The experimental EXAFS data was fitted by ARTEMIS program.

281

282 **3**.

283

3. Results and discussion

3.1 Catalytic performances of CO₂ methanation

The CO₂ methanation was carried out at reaction temperature range of 100-550 °C 284 with a weight hourly space velocity (WHSV) of 48,000 mL g⁻¹ h⁻¹. Catalytic performances of 285 TiO₂, 3, 6, 12 and 20wt% of Ni-loaded TiO₂ samples were displayed in term of CO₂ conversion 286 as a function of temperature. The CO₂ conversion, products (CH₄ and CO) selectivities and 287 yields are represented in Figure 3(a)-3(e). The CO₂ conversion for all samples increased 288 according to reaction temperature. However, upon the addition of Ni onto TiO₂, shifting of CO₂ 289 conversion toward lower reaction temperature were observed. For bare TiO₂, the catalytic 290 performance was almost inactive with illustrating of the lowest CO₂ conversion and low CH₄ 291 292 yield and selectivity, while CO selectivity was relatively high. In contrast, Ni supported TiO₂ 293 catalysts (3, 6, 12 and 20wt% Ni/TiO₂) exhibited a dramatically enhance in catalytic activities which can be observed by increasing of CO₂ conversion at lower reaction temperature. Upon 294 addition of Ni, product selectivities were changed, i.e., CH₄ yield were developed and 295 selectivity toward CH₄ were almost 100%, while CO yield and selectivity were rapidly dropped 296 to lower 10%. This result indicated that addition of Ni onto TiO₂ support improved the desired 297

- product (CH₄) selectivity and suppressed an unwanted product (CO). Increase of Ni concentration resulted in increasing of CO₂ conversion and CH₄ yield, while CH₄ selectivities were almost nearly the same (~100%) for all samples. However, 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ exhibited the highest CO₂ conversion and CH₄ yield, it is noteworthy that the CH₄ selectivity was almost 100% in the wide range of reaction temperature (150-450 °C).
- In order to study the kinetic parameter (apparent activation energy), heat and mass 303 transfer effects were checked during measurement of reaction rate by the Koros-Nowak test 304 [22]. The catalytic performances were tested by using samples with different of Ni active site 305 loading (6wt% and 20wt% Ni) at 250 °C at feed gas ratio of $H_2/CO_2/He = 24:6:10$ and WHSV 306 = 48,000 mL g⁻¹ h⁻¹. The results revealed that the CO₂ conversion of 6wt% Ni/TiO₂ and 20wt% 307 Ni/TiO₂ were 1.90 and 4.30 %, respectively, while turn over frequency (TOF) were almost the 308 same values (0.27 s⁻¹ and 0.25 s⁻¹, respectively). Therefore, it was attributed that heat and mass 309 transfer were absence for this experiment condition. 310
- 311 The apparent activation energy (E_a) was usually used to elucidate the catalytic performance in enhancing the reaction rate. This value can be obtained by using the Arrhenius 312 equation ($k = Ae^{-E_a/RT}$). The plotting between ln(rate) and reciprocal of absolute temperature 313 (1/T) was constructed. The slope of the linear graph was used to calculate the apparent 314 activation energy. Figure 4 illustrates the Arrhenius plots of 3, 6, 12 and 20wt% Ni/TiO₂. It 315 was seen that the apparent activation energies were decreased with increasing of Ni content (Ea 316 ranges between 68-78 kJ mol⁻¹). Reduction of apparent activation energy upon more Ni 317 addition indicated that lower kinetic barrier for catalyzing toward the reaction, thus, the 318 catalytic activity can be enhanced. The E_a values were corresponded to the catalytic activities 319 320 results that 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ exhibited the highest CO₂ conversion due to the lowest E_a for this reaction. The long-term stability test is also an important property to determine the efficiency 321 322 of catalyst in thermal sintering for industrial scale. Figure 5 exhibits the CO₂ conversion and CH₄ yield of 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ in CO₂ methanation for 72 h. The stability test of 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ 323 was done by keeping the reaction temperature at 420 °C since this temperature exhibited the 324 highest in CO₂ conversion. The CO₂ conversion was stable during 72 h on stream (decrease 325

- not over 10%) which was corresponded to consistency of CH₄ selectivity (almost 100%) for
- this sample.



Figure 3 (a) CO₂ conversion, (b) CH₄ yield, (c) CH₄ selectivity, (d) CO yield and (e) CO selectivity of all catalysts; TiO₂, 3, 6, 12 and 20wt% Ni-loaded TiO₂ by using H₂/CO₂/He = 24:6:10, total flow rate 40 mL min⁻¹, WHSV = 48,000 mL g⁻¹ h⁻¹ at reaction temperature 100-550 °C.



Figure 4 Arrhenius plots for the CO₂ methanation with different Ni contents on TiO₂; TiO₂,
3, 6, 12 and 20wt% Ni/ TiO₂.



334Figure 5 CO_2 conversion and CH_4 selectivity over 20wt% Ni/ TiO₂ during long-term stability335test at reaction temperature of 420 °C, H₂/CO₂/He = 24:6:10 and WHSV = 48,000336mL g⁻¹ h⁻¹.

3.2 Standard characterization

338

3.2.1 X-ray diffraction (XRD)

339 XRD patterns of TiO₂ with various Ni contents (3, 6, 12 and 20wt%) are 340 shown in Figure 6. The XRD peaks of TiO₂ were observed at 25.3°, 37.8°, 48.0°, 53.9°, 55.1, 62.7. 68.9°, 70.3° and 75.1° which were corresponding to (101), (004), (200), (105), (211), 341 (204), (110), (220) and (215) planes of anatase structure with using JICST database (from The 342 Crystallographic Society of Japan). For all Ni-loaded catalysts (3, 6, 12 and 20wt%), the 343 anatase structure of TiO₂ remained unchanged. However, the intense diffraction peaks 344 decreased when increasing of Ni loading. The lowering of these peaks related to reducing of 345 crystallinities and crystalline sizes of TiO_2 . This indicated that addition of Ni into TiO_2 during 346 sol-gel process can prevent the crystalline growth of TiO₂ [23]. It was found that the crystalline 347 sizes of TiO₂ were reduced with more added of Ni content as illustrated in Table 1. In addition, 348 shifting of diffraction peaks to lower diffraction angles were also observed which indicated to 349 unit cell expansion. This phenomenon resulted from the substitution of Ti⁴⁺ ion by larger Ni²⁺ 350 ion (ionic radii of $Ni^{2+} = 0.72$ Å and $Ti^{4+} = 0.68$ Å for 6-fold coordination). The unit cell of 351 TiO₂ catalyst was enlarged upon increase of Ni content which indicated to more incorporation 352 of Ni²⁺ ions into TiO₂ lattice [24-26]. To confirm the incorporation of adding metal into host 353 lattice, the Williamson-Hall (W-H) parameter was used. Upon incorporation of adding metal, 354

the host lattice was distorted and strain was increased. In this case, Ti^{4+} site was replaced by Ni²⁺ divalent cation, thus oxygen vacancies were expected to form. Therefore, the W-H parameter can indicate to the degree of incorporation of adding metal [27,28]. Table 1 summarizes the unit cell parameter, unit cell volume and lattice strain of all synthesized samples. It can be seen that the unit cell parameter and unit cell volume were increased with increasing of Ni loading. The lattice strain was also enlarged which indicated to higher amount of incorporated Ni²⁺ into TiO₂ lattice upon increase of Ni content.

Besides the TiO₂ anatase diffraction peaks, another additional important peak was also 362 363 observed, i.e., NiO diffraction peak at 43.5°. This peak was attributed to a face centered-cubic 364 crystalline structure of NiO. It was noteworthy that this peak was not observed in the low Ni content sample (3wt% Ni/TiO₂). This was probably due to completely incorporate of adding 365 366 Ni ion into TiO₂ and the solid solution was formed. In contrast, the NiO diffraction peak was obviously appeared for Ni loading \geq 6wt%. This result can imply that addition of Ni was 367 existed in two forms, i.e., incorporation of Ni ion into TiO₂ lattice and dispersion of NiO onto 368 TiO₂ surface. Therefore, there was a limitation or saturated level of incorporation of Ni ion into 369 370 TiO₂ lattice and then the excess of Ni added amount can disperse onto TiO₂ surface. From this behavior, both shifting of XRD peaks and existing of NiO peak were observed. In order to 371 estimate the saturated value of Ni concentration, the relationship between unit cell volume and 372 373 Ni content was constructed as illustrated in Figure 7. It can be seen that the unit cell volume was increased upon addition of Ni and the expansion of lattice was almost constant at higher 374 Ni loading more than 6wt%. Form this plot, the saturated Ni incorporated amount was in the 375 range between 3-6wt%. Therefore, from our results, we assumed that the saturated Ni 376 incorporated amount was 3wt% which mean that all Ni addition was incorporated into TiO₂ 377 lattice at this added level. Increasing of Ni content at higher amount than 6wt%, the excess 378 amount of adding Ni was dispersed onto TiO₂ surface and more intense of NiO diffraction peak 379 was observed which indicated to higher crystallinity and crystalline size of NiO phase. To 380 evidence the substitution of Ni ion into TiO₂ lattice and dispersion of NiO phase onto catalyst 381 surface, X-ray Absorption Spectroscopy (XAS) results were used and discussed in the next 382 383 part.

384

385





(a) XRD diffraction patterns of all catalysts.

(b) magnification of (101) crystallographic plane for all catalysts to compare the shifting of the diffraction peak.



389 Figure 7 Relationship between unit cell parameters of all catalysts against Ni content.390

Table 1 Structural and physical properties of all synthesized samples including lattice 391 392

-							
Samples	Lat paran (2	tice neter ^a Å)	Cell volume ^a	Crystal size ^b (nm)		Lattice strain ^c	Ni contents ^d (wt%)
	a = b	с	(A)	Anatase	Ni		
TiO2	3.778	9.516	135.81	14.92	-	3.65×10^{-4}	-
3wt% Ni/TiO ₂	3.791	9.506	136.63	11.41	3.99	7.35×10^{-4}	2.92
6wt% Ni/TiO ₂	3.793	9.501	136.85	10.63	4.55	1.66×10^{-3}	6.07

136.87

136.88

parameter, cell volume, crystal size, lattice strain and Ni content.

^aCalculated from the plane (101), (004), (100) by Bragg's equation.

^bCalculated from the plane (101) for anatase and (111) for Ni using Scherer's equation.

°Calculated from Williamson-Hall (W-H).

12wt% Ni/TiO₂ 3.801 9.475 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ 3.780 9.483

^dCalculated from ICP-OES results.

20wt% Ni/TiO₂

393 394

3.2.2 Structural study of Ni-loaded TiO₂ catalysts by X-ray Absorption **Spectroscopy (XAS)**

8.37

7.84

3.98

5.31

 4.03×10^{-3}

 7.83×10^{-3}

13.5

21.5

395 As discussed above that there were two forms of Ni addition; Ni substitution and NiO dispersion, thus in this part, X-ray Absorption Spectroscopy (XAS) results were used 396 397 to evidence the existing of these two forms. The first form, substituted of Ni ion into TiO₂, Extended X-ray Absorption Fine Structure (EXAFS) of 3wt% Ni/TiO2 was analyzed and 398 399 discussed to confirm the substitution of Ni ion into TiO₂ lattice. Another form, dispersed NiO, 400 linear combination between substitution Ni and NiO was performed and then the percentage 401 composition of substitution Ni and NiO were determined.

For Ni substitution form, analysis of EXAFS result of 3wt% Ni/TiO₂ was 402 used since we assumed the complete substitution of all added Ni amount for this sample. The 403 Ti K-edge EXAFS oscillation spectra and Fourier transformed functions for TiO₂ and 3wt% 404 Ni/TiO₂ by using anatase TiO₂ (space group I4₁/amd) as a model for fitting are shown in Figure 405 8. For Ni-loaded TiO₂ sample, the FT-EXAFS spectra were obtained by fitting with anatase 406 TiO₂ and replacing one atom of the nearest Ti atom with Ni. The k²-weighted Fourier transform 407 was used (Figure 8(a)). The weight EXAFS data in k space was in the range from 3-10 \AA^{-1} and 408 was transformed to R space without phase collection (Figure 8(b)). The structural parameters 409 of TiO₂ and 3wt% Ni/TiO₂ for Ti K-edge are summarized in Table 2. For Figure 8(b), the sharp 410 peak of TiO₂ at ~1.5 Å was referred to the oscillation of Ti–O in the first shell. Upon 411

incorporation of Ni in second shell of TiO₂ lattice, the Ti–O bond distance were distorted (as
shown in Table 2), while the Ti–Ni bond length was elongated due to substitution by larger
cation and then resulted in shortening of Ti–Ti bond distance.

From the results of XRD, it can be seen that both Ni incorporated and 415 dispersed phase of NiO were observed, especially for high Ni content than 6wt%. In order to 416 determine the compositions of these two forms of Ni species, linear combination of XANES 417 spectra were employed. For this approach, we assumed that all Ni loading at 3wt% was 418 completely substituted into TiO₂ lattice, thus the excess amount of added Ni (higher than 3wt%) 419 420 was existed in NiO dispersed form. Therefore, the linear combination between substituted Ni and dispersed NiO was constructed and was used as a standard to estimate the composition 421 between two forms of Ni species. For this work, Ni K-edge XANES spectrum of 3wt% Ni/TiO₂ 422 was used as a standard for Ni substitution while that of NiO was used as a standard for NiO 423 dispersion phase. Figure 9 displays the percentage of two forms of Ni species obtained from 424 linear combination fitting. It was seen that NiO phase increased with Ni content which was 425 corresponding to XRD results. 426



427 **Figure 8** (a) Ti K-edge EXAFS oscillation data with $k^2\chi(k)$ for TiO₂ and 3wt% Ni/TiO₂.





429	Table 2	Structural parameter for	or Ti K-edge EXAFS	fitting analysis
-----	---------	--------------------------	--------------------	------------------

Samples	Shells	Best fit EXAFS parameters				
Samples	Shens	Ν	σ^2	$\Delta E (eV)$	R (Å)	
	Ti-O	2.3	0.003		1.908	
TiO ₂	Ti-O	1.2	0.001	1.439	1.996	
	Ti-Ti	2.3	0.007		3.088	
	Ti-O	1.9	0.001		1.927	
3wt% Ni/TiO ₂	Ti-O	0.9	0.003	1 474	1.947	
	Ti-Ti	1.4	0.002	1.4/4	3.051	
	Ti-Ni	0.5	0.003		3.291	



Figure 9 The comparison between Ni substitution amount and NiO phase of all Niloaded catalysts which obtained from comparing to a linear combination of XANES data of
Ni K-edge between 3wt% Ni/TiO₂ and NiO.

3.2.3 Surface and physical properties of catalysts

The surface properties of TiO₂ and modified-TiO₂ catalysts were estimated 438 by N₂ adsorption-desorption technique. The N₂ adsorption-desorption isotherms are displayed 439 in Figure 10. All isotherms exhibited an adsorption-desorption feature corresponded to 440 mesoporous materials. The surface area, pore size and pore volume of samples are summarized 441 in Table 3. The BET surface area of pure TiO₂ was 72 m²/g with pore volume of 0.15 cm³/g. 442 The Ni modified TiO₂ samples exhibited higher BET surface area and pore volume than that 443 of original TiO₂ upon increasing of Ni addition amount. The surface area of 3, 6, 12 and 20wt% 444 Ni/TiO₂ were ca. 92, 95, 100 and 108 m^2/g , respectively. These results were in agreement with 445 XRD analysis which mentioned the prevention of anatase crystal growth by Ni addition and 446 447 led to lowering of TiO₂ crystalline sizes. Higher surface area was important to improve the active surface sites to adsorb gas substrates for CO₂ methanation [29]. The pore size 448 449 distributions of the synthesized samples were in the range of 2-16 nm (inset). The pore diameter 450 distributions of TiO₂ and 3wt% Ni/TiO₂ gained the maximum value at 9 nm whereas higher Ni 451 contents samples (6, 12 and 20wt% Ni/TiO₂) provided the smaller of diameter at a maximum peak around 6 nm. Pore volumes of Ni-added samples were higher than that of pure TiO_2 . 452

The percentage of added Ni content in all Ni-loaded catalysts were determined by inductively couple plasma-optical emission spectroscopy and the results are summarized in Table 1. The obtained results of Ni content from ICP-OES in all Ni-loaded catalysts exhibited a similar value to nominated added amount (2.92, 6.07, 13.5 and 21.5wt% Ni for 3, 6, 12 and 20wt% Ni/TiO₂, respectively).

The morphology of fresh TiO₂ and Ni supported TiO₂ are showed in Figure 458 11(a-e). The shape of particles for all samples were uniformly spherical and there was no 459 change of the anatase morphology for all Ni catalysts. The means of anatase particle sizes were 460 461 approximately in the range of 8-15 nm and the particle sizes were decreased upon increasing of Ni content which was in agreement with XRD results. NiO was characterized using high-462 resolution TEM for 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ resulting in Figure 11(f). The detection of lattice spacing 463 0.210 nm can be indexed as (200) plane of FCC Ni which were related to XRD patterns. This 464 result was confirmed the existence and dispersion of NiO. 465





Samples	Surface area ^a (m ² /g)	Pore volume ^a (cm ³ /g)	Pore size ^a (nm)	H ₂ consumption ^b (mmol/g)	H ₂ chemisorbed ^c (µmol/g)
TiO ₂	71.48	0.1490	8.340	-	-
3wt% Ni/TiO ₂	91.80	0.1743	7.596	13.9	5.8
6wt% Ni/TiO ₂	95.41	0.1776	7.745	31.1	13.8
12wt% Ni/TiO2	100.3	0.1749	6.947	62.5	25.5
20wt% Ni/TiO ₂	107.6	0.1934	7.191	76.2	43.4

487 **Table 3** Surface properties of samples (TiO₂, 3, 6, 12 and 20wt% Ni/TiO₂).

^aEstimated from N₂ adsorption-desorption.

^bEstimated from H₂-TPR.

^cEstimated from H₂ chemisorption.



488 Figure 11 TEM images of (a) TiO₂, (b) 3, (c) 6, (d) 12, (e) 20wt % Ni-loaded TiO₂ and
489 (f) HRTEM for 20wt % Ni-loaded TiO₂.
490
491

3.3.3 H₂ Temperature Program Reduction (H₂-TPR) and H₂ chemisorption

H₂ Temperature Program Reduction (H₂-TPR) is attributed to the interaction 493 of metal active site and support. Figure 12 demonstrates the TPR profiles of 3, 6, 12 and 20wt% 494 Ni-loaded TiO₂ catalysts. The reduction peaks were observed in the range of 250-450 °C which 495 were assigned as conversion of Ni²⁺ to Ni⁰ on surface which interacted with TiO₂ support 496 [30,31]. The different reduction temperature of NiO was attributed to different degree of 497 interaction between NiO and TiO_2 support. This behavior depended on the preparation method 498 499 and calcination temperature since these factors caused a different NiO dispersion state, NiO sizes and degree of interaction with TiO₂ and thus resulted in different reducibility of NiO 500 particles. The shifting of NiO reduction peaks to higher temperature were observed upon 501 increasing of Ni content which indicated to high dispersion of NiO species with stronger 502 interaction with TiO₂ support [32]. Moreover, H₂ consumption considerably enhanced with the 503 504 increase of Ni additions as follows: 3 < 6 < 12 < 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ as shown in Table 3. The signal of H₂-TPR is referred to the amount of H₂ consumption, i.e., more intense of reduction 505 506 peak implies to high H₂ consumption to reduce the metal in a catalyst. It was clearly seen that H₂ consumption was related to amount of NiO phase reduction to Ni metal; 20wt% Ni-modified 507 508 TiO₂ provided 76.2 mmol/g of H₂ which was 5.5 times higher that H₂ consumption of 3wt% Ni-modified TiO₂. 509

In order to validate the exposed NiO and/or Ni active species on catalyst 510 511 surface, H₂-chemisorption experiment was conducted. Due to H₂ favor to adsorb on metal active site, thus higher amount of H₂ chemisorbed can indicate to higher amount of metal active 512 site. Table 3 illustrates the amount of H₂ chemisorbed of all catalysts. It is seen that the H₂ 513 chemisorbed amount was increased with increasing of Ni loading on catalyst surface which 514 corresponded to higher area of Ni adsorption sites for H₂. Since H₂ is one of the reactants for 515 516 CO₂ methanation, thus the results of H₂ chemisorption was related to enhance of catalytic activities of Ni-loaded catalysts which will be discussed in the latter part. 517





519

3.3 X-ray Absorption Spectroscopy analysis

520 From catalytic activities results, it was found that addition of Ni into TiO₂ lattice 521 led to structural, physical and redox properties changing which also evidenced the altering of 522 catalytic activities performance. In this part, X-ray Absorption Spectroscopy (XAS) was used to investigate the electronic state changing of Ni and Ti in freshly prepared catalysts and 523 monitor the changing of the catalysts during CO₂ methanation. The changing of catalysts 524 properties was studied by using data analysis of two regions; X-ray Absorption Near Edge 525 Structure (XANES) and Extended X-ray Absorption Fine Structure (EXAFS). All of data 526 reduction from XAS can be used to understand and describe the effect of Ni addition into TiO₂ 527 in improving CO₂ methanation. 528

529 530

3.3.1 X-ray Absorption Near Edge Structure (XANES) for monitoring Ni and Ti oxidation states

This part is divided into two parts; 1) ex-situ XANES analysis for freshly synthesized catalyst and 2) in-situ XANES analysis for monitoring Ni and Ti oxidation state during CO₂ methanation.

Figure 13(a) illustrates Ni K-edge XANES spectra of all freshly prepared 534 Ni-loaded TiO₂ catalysts compared with Ni foil and NiO standards. The Ni foil spectrum 535 exhibits an edge energy at around 8333 eV which is attributed to the electron transition from 536 1s to 3d orbital [33]. For NiO standard, the white line peak at 8347 eV was observed which 537 corresponded to multiple scattering process in octahedral NiO [33,34]. The oxidation state of 538 probe atom can be initially estimated by comparing with the standard XANES spectra with 539 certain oxidation state. From Figure 13(a), the Ni XANES spectra of Ni-loaded samples were 540 541 almost identical to NiO standard spectrum which indicated to oxidation state of Ni-loaded TiO₂ 542 in all samples were 2+. Moreover, in order to elucidate the oxidation state of Ni, the relationship between ΔE (different of edge energy relative with Ni foil) and oxidation state of Ni was 543 constructed. The edge energy of all samples can be obtained by taking the first derivative of 544 545 those spectra and the turning point was assigned as an edge energy. Figure 13(b) displays the 546 relationship between ΔE and oxidation states of Ni for all Ni-loaded samples compared with two Ni standards. It can be seen that the apparent oxidation states of Ni for all Ni-loaded 547 samples were 2+. Normalized Ti K-edge XANES spectra of all fresh as-synthesized samples 548 display in Figure 14. Characteristic peaks of TiO₂ support and Ni-loaded samples were marked 549 as pre-edge peaks A₁–A₃ and B a shoulder peak as C and a white line peak as D as shown in 550 551 Figure 14(a) [35]. The first pre-edge peak (A_1) was corresponding to a quadrupole transition to 3d (t_{2g}) state of the TiO₆ octahedron while that of A₃ and B peaks were assigned as dipole 552 553 transition from 1s to hybridized p-d state of t_{2g} and e_g, respectively. The A₂ was not noticed in the larger size of anatase and rutile TiO_2 , but this peak appeared in the case of the small sized 554 nanostructures [36]. The shoulder C was noted as transition shakedown process while that of 555 D was assigned as transition of 1s to out-of-plane $4p_z$ orbital [37]. The structures of all fresh 556 samples were detected as anatase TiO₂ structure with consisted of Ti⁴⁺ surrounding with six-557 fold coordinate which were related to XRD results. It is known that formation of oxygen 558 vacancies within TiO₂ lattice lead to change of Ti⁴⁺ oxidation state to Ti³⁺ and distortion in the 559 local TiO₆ octahedral coordination [38]. In the first change, the changing of Ti⁴⁺ oxidation state 560 to Ti³⁺ was not observed from our results which might be due to small amount of metal addition 561 when comparing with bulk TiO_2 concentration, thus, the changing of Ti^{3+} was too small. On 562 the other hand, the distortion in TiO₂ octahedral is caused from elongation or shortening of Ti-563 O bond length. Changing of Ti–O bond length lead to alteration of Ti 3d and O 2p density of 564 state (DOS) and the changing of Ti–O orbital overlap results in changing the total DOS and its 565 566 corresponding to electronic transition which reflected to the pre-edge feature [39]. The

changing of pre-edge feature is usually used to indicate the influence of metal substitution into 567 host lattice. The pre-edge intensities were related to the symmetry of the crystal lattice, thus, a 568 distortion and oxygen vacancies can cause an increase of pre-edge peaks [38-42]. Figure 14(b) 569 shows Ti K-edge in the pre-edge region for TiO₂ and 3wt% Ni/TiO₂ and 20wt% Ni/TiO₂. The 570 pre-edge intensities increased with increasing of Ni content which was attributed to higher 571 distortion and oxygen vacancies formation within TiO₂ lattice. This result can also confirm the 572 substitution of Ni²⁺ ions into Ti⁴⁺ sites which led to oxygen vacancies formation and distortion 573 of TiO₂ lattice. This phenomenon was in agreement with XRD and Ti EXAFS analysis for 574 575 3wt% Ni/TiO₂ as discussed in the first part.

576 Second part is in-situ XANES analysis for monitoring Ni and Ti oxidation 577 states during CO₂ methanation. In-situ Time-Resolve X-ray Absorption Spectroscopy (in-situ 578 TR-XAS) was used to obtain the XANES results. 20% wt Ni/TiO₂ synthesized sample 579 performed the highest CO₂ methanation activity, thus, this sample was selected to study by in-580 situ TR-XAS.

The original Ni oxidation state of freshly prepared Ni catalysts was +2 581 which were confirmed by XANES results in previous part. In in-situ experiment, catalyst 582 surface was cleaned up and reduced by using H₂ during heating from 50 to 450 °C as shown in 583 Figure 15(a). During H₂ pretreatment, the characteristic peak of Ni species did not change in 584 the temperature range from 50 to 340 °C. After that, the white line intensity of Ni²⁺ (8347 eV) 585 586 obviously decreased and then the feature of spectra was slightly changed with increase of 587 pretreatment temperature and completely converted at 450 °C. After the temperature reached to 450 °C, the pretreatment temperature was hold at this point for 90 min to maintain metallic 588 589 Ni active species before staring the reaction [43,44]. It indicated that the H₂ pretreatment process resulted in reduction of NiO to Ni⁰. Figure 15(b) shows in-situ TR-XAS results of 590 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ during CO₂ methanation with H_2/CO_2 ratio = 4 at reaction temperature range 591 of 150 to 550 °C. The oxidation state of Ni remained unchanged during CO₂ methanation (Ni⁰) 592 within the whole range of reaction temperature. 593

Figure 16(a) shows in-situ TR-XAS results of Ti K-edge for 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ over H₂ pretreatment condition at 50 to 450 °C. It can be seen that the spectra of 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ under pretreatment condition remained unchanged (Ti⁴⁺) and after conducting the CO₂ methanation, the oxidation state of Ti was still unchanged which can be observed by the same spectra feature of Ti K-edge for both pretreatment and reduction process (Figure 16(b)).











Figure 15 in-situ Ni K-edge XANES spectra obtained from TR-XAS experiment of
20% wt Ni/TiO₂: (a) pretreatment condition and (b) CO₂ methanation.



Figure 16 in-situ Ti K-edge TR-XAS experiment of 20% wt Ni/TiO₂: (a) pretreatment
condition and (b) CO₂ methanation.

3.3.2 Extended X-ray absorption Fine Structure (EXAFS) study for

615 monitoring Ni oxidation state during CO₂ methanation

Several works reported that Ni species on the catalyst surface is an important 616 active site for enhancing CO₂ methanation rate since H₂ favors to adsorb on metal active site. 617 Therefore, in this part, EXAFS analysis data was conducted to understand the state of Ni, 618 structural changing of Ni during CO₂ methanation. The Fourier transformed function without 619 phase correction of in-situ Ni K-edge EXAFS oscillation for 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ at the reaction 620 temperature of 150, 350 and 550 °C is shown in Figure 17. The feature of all XANES spectra 621 were similar to that of Ni foil. However, the amplitude of the spectra decreased with increased 622 reaction temperature. Since, the amplitude is related to the coordination number around Ni 623 probe atom, thus, EXAFS analysis can provide the information on the changing of Ni species 624 during CO₂ methanation. The experimental data was normalized and the spectra were amplified 625 by k^2 weight with R space window in the range of 1-5 Å and k range of 3-10 Å⁻¹. Figure 18(a) 626 and 18(b) displays the k^2 weight and the radial function of Ni K-edge EXAFS spectra for 627 20wt% Ni/TiO₂, respectively. The calculated EXAFS of all catalysts were obtained by fitting 628 with the cubic closed-packed (CCP) Ni structure. The best fitting analysis parameters are 629 summarized in Table 4. The fitting results showed a first strongest peak at around 2.0 Å (2.48 630 Å from fitting) which assigned to a single scattering path of absorbing Ni atom with the nearest 631 neighboring Ni atom (Ni-Ni). The calculated coordination number for Ni foil was 9.3 which 632 indicated that Ni probe atom was surrounded by approximately 9 atoms. From Table 4, the 633 calculated coordination number of 20wt% Ni/TiO2 at 150, 350 and 550 °C were reduced to 7.6, 634 7.1 and 6.0, respectively. The lowering of coordination number of 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ with 635 increasing of reaction temperature implied to higher level of unsaturated Ni-Ni coordination. 636 High unsaturated of Ni-Ni coordination number can promote the dissociation of hydrogen on 637 638 catalyst surface which can lead to high catalytic activity [45,46]. Therefore, high unsaturated Ni–Ni coordination number at high temperature (indicated by lowering of C.N.) provided high 639 possibility of H₂ adsorption. However, the adsorption ability of H₂ on an active site was one of 640 the factor to describe the catalytic performance. In order to describe the catalytic activities 641 enhancement, understanding on the adsorption behavior of two reactants should be studied. 642

643

644



Figure 17 Fourier Transform functions of *in-situ* EXAFS oscillation (without phase collection) of Ni foil and 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ at 150, 350 and 550 °C under CO₂
methanation.





648	Figure 18	(a) The k^2 weight EXAFS spectra of 20wt% Ni/TiO_2 at 150, 350 and 550 $^\circ\text{C}$
649		under CO ₂ methanation.
650		(b) The radial function of Ni K-edge EXAFS of $20wt\%$ Ni/TiO ₂ at 150, 350 and
651		550 °C under CO ₂ methanation.
652		

Table 4 The best fitting parameters of 20wt% Ni/TiO₂.

Samples	Shells	Best fit EXAFS parameters				
	~~~~~	Ν	$\sigma^2$	$\Delta E (eV)$	R (Å)	
Ni foil	Ni–Ni	9.3	0.0056	6.776	2.48	
$CO_2 + H_2 + He \ 150 \ ^\circ C$	Ni–Ni	7.6	0.0088	6.417	2.48	
$CO_2 + H_2 + He 350 \ ^\circ C$	Ni–Ni	7.1	0.0120	6.223	2.48	
$CO_2 + H_2 + He 550 \ ^\circ C$	Ni–Ni	6.0	0.0130	6.240	2.48	

# 3.4 The role of added Ni on enhancing CO₂ methanation

It has been reported that a different preparation method had a significant effect on
physical and chemical properties of the catalysts which can be altered to the catalytic activities.
In this work, sol-gel method was used to synthesize the catalyst for using in CO₂ methanation.

Since, this method is one of the reducible methods for preparing the catalyst, thus this method 659 was employed. In the catalytic reaction, adsorption of the reactants on the catalyst surface is 660 one of the most important elementary steps to control and dominate the catalytic reaction rate. 661 Therefore, to speed up the reaction rate, enhancing the reactants adsorption ability on catalyst 662 surface must be done. For CO₂ methanation, CO₂ and H₂ adsorption on catalyst surface can be 663 664 enhanced by different approach. For CO₂ molecules, providing the basicity sites on the catalyst surface can increase the CO₂ adsorption capacity by acid-base interaction or existing of oxygen 665 vacancy can also improve the adsorption capacity [47-49]. While H₂ molecules, it is known 666 667 that H₂ favors to adsorb on metallic metal sites, especially on transition metals group, in dissociative form, thus dispersing of metal active sites on the catalyst surface can increase the 668 H₂ adsorption capacity. Consequently, modification of the catalyst by above approaches would 669 lead to increase of adsorption rate of reactants and also speed up the reaction rate. Preparation 670 and modification by sol-gel method was used to alter the surface and catalyst properties which 671 can provide both oxygen vacancies and metal active sites for CO₂ and H₂ adsorption, 672 respectively. For CO₂ methanation, nickle was usually used to modify on support surface to 673 674 increase the activity of the catalyst. In this work, added Ni on  $TiO_2$  support acted as a bifunctional role in enhancing CO₂ methanation rate. First, addition of Ni during TiO₂ sol-gel 675 process led to incorporation of Ni²⁺ into TiO₂ lattice and resulted in strain and unbalanced 676 charge and then oxygen vacancy was formed (this result can be evidenced by EXAFS data.). 677 The oxygen vacancy was an active site for CO₂ adsorption; i.e., CO₂ interacted with oxygen 678 vacancies by strong interaction and weakened the C=O bond [50,51]. Second, the excess 679 680 amount of added Ni was existed in NiO form which might be located on the catalyst surface and this NiO phase was an active site for H₂ adsorption (after reduction to Ni⁰ by pretreatment 681 682 process before starting the reaction). Moreover, increasing of NiO crystallinity upon increase of Ni content was observed (increase of NiO peak intensity in XRD pattern) which resulted in 683 lowering or inhibiting of TiO₂ crystal growth [52]. From this effect, smaller crystalline size of 684 TiO₂ was occurred and higher surface area was observed. Figure 19(a)-19(c) illustrates the 685 comparison of CO2 methanation catalytic activities between 20wt% Ni/TiO2 obtained by sol-686 gel and impregnation method. It is seen that addition of Ni into TiO₂ support by sol-gel method 687 exhibited higher catalytic activity than that by impregnation method. Although, impregnation 688 method is one of the simplest preparation method but the obtained catalyst properties were 689 lowered, especially surface area and porosity which was an important properties that can 690 dominate to the reduction rate. From Figure 19(d)-19(e), beside the higher catalytic activity of 691

692 catalyst obtained from sol-gel method, this catalyst was more selectively toward to CH₄ than693 CO while the impregnated catalyst exhibited an opposite result.

In order to evidence the role of added Ni in enhancing the reaction rate, CO₂ and 694 H₂ adsorption studies were conducted. Since, in catalyst cycle, the adsorption of reactants on 695 catalyst surface is usually assigned as a rate determining step, therefore, investigation of 696 697 adsorption process can provide the information that can be used to understand and describe the role of catalyst in enhancing the reaction rate. For CO₂ methanation, increasing of CO₂ and H₂ 698 adsorption can enhance the reaction rate, since, higher amount of adsorbed CO₂ and H₂ on 699 700 catalyst surface would lead to more possibility to react and convert to products. In the case of H₂ adsorption, the results are illustrated in H₂-chemisorption part and are summarized in Table 701 3. It is assumed that only  $H_2$  was adsorbed on Ni active site, thus higher amount of  $H_2$ 702 chemisorbed would be implied to higher Ni active area on catalyst surface. The results from 703 Table 3 showed that H₂ chemisorption amount was increased with increasing of Ni content 704 (5.80, 13.8, 25.5 and 43.4  $\mu$ mol g⁻¹ for 3, 6, 12 and 20wt%, respectively). For CO₂ adsorption 705 study, thermogravimetric analysis (TGA) was used. The CO₂ uptake experiment was conducted 706 at 40 °C (the lowest temperature for the apparatus) and ambient pressure for 110 min. Figure 707 708 20 illustrates the data reduction from TGA experiment which expressed in the term of CO₂ uptake at interval time. The results showed that the CO₂ uptake increased with time and almost 709 710 constant within 60 min. The amount of  $CO_2$  uptake was increased with Ni content (0.189, 0248, 0.349 and 0.377 mmol g⁻¹ for 0, 3, 6 and 12wt% Ni, respectively). The results from XRD and 711 EXAFS indicated that added Ni²⁺ was substituted into TiO₂ lattice and led to formation of 712 oxygen vacancies which was reactive for CO₂ adsorption. However, increased Ni content up to 713 20wt%, the CO₂ uptake was slightly dropped. This result can be used to relate with the highest 714 catalytic activities of 20wt% Ni/TiO₂. Since, the adsorption sites for CO₂ and H₂ were co-exist 715 on the catalyst surface then if higher amount of adsorbed CO₂, inhibition and suppression of 716 H₂ adsorption on metal active site was probably occurred and then led to decrease of surface 717 reaction between adsorbed CO₂ and H₂ and finally lower the catalytic activity. Therefore, an 718 appropriate amount of adsorbed CO₂ and H₂ on catalyst surface would lead to high catalytic 719 activities. Figure 21 shows the relationship between H₂ chemisorption and CO₂ uptake as a 720 721 function of Ni content. It was found that 20wt% Ni/TiO₂ can maximize the CO₂ methanation rate. This result caused from the improvement of catalyst properties by addition of Ni which 722 723 led to existence of active sites with appropriate performance to promote the  $CO_2$  and  $H_2$ adsorption. 724



**Figure 19** (a) CO2 conversion, (b) CH4 yield, (c) CH4 selectivity, (d) CO yield and (e) COreadselectivity of 20wt% Ni-loaded TiO2 by preparing with different preparationmethods; sol-gel and impregnation. The H2/CO2/He ratio was 24:6:10, total flowrate was 40 mL min⁻¹ and WHSV was 48,000 mL g⁻¹ h⁻¹ at reaction temperature100-550 °C.



**Figure 20** CO₂ uptake from TGA experiment for 0, 3, 6, 12 and 20wt% Ni/TiO₂.



Figure 21 The relationship between H₂ chemisorption and CO₂ uptake as a function of Ni content.

#### 734 **4.** Conclusion

In this work, the role of added Ni into TiO₂ support in enhancing CO₂ methanation rate 735 was studied. The Ni supported  $TiO_2$  with different amount of Ni loading as 3, 6, 12 and 20wt% 736 Ni were synthesized by sol-gel method. The preparation method by addition of Ni during TiO₂ 737 sol-gel process led to structural and surface properties changing which could alter to their 738 catalytic activities. The results show that added Ni modified the catalyst properties in 2 ways; 739 740 i)  $Ni^{2+}$  was substituted into TiO₂ lattice which led to strain and unbalanced charge and then creating the oxygen vacancy. This effect can be evidenced by the results from distortion of Ti-741 742 O, Ti–Ti bond length (EXAFS analysis) and the enlargement of TiO₂ unit cell (XRD results). ii) upon increasing of Ni content, the excess amount of Ni was presented in NiO formed and 743 probably located on the catalyst surface. This can be seen from the diffraction peak of NiO in 744 XRD pattern. Moreover, the crystallinity of NiO increased with increasing Ni content which 745 could inhibit to TiO₂ crystal growth and resulted in smaller TiO₂ crystalline sizes and then 746 higher surface area was occurred. The existence of oxygen vacancy and NiO phase can be 747 evidenced by XANES linear combination analysis. The results showed that NiO phase was 748 increased with increasing of Ni loading. These two species that produced from addition of Ni 749 750 during TiO₂ sol-gel process has a significant role in enhancing the CO₂ methanation rate. Both 751 oxygen vacancy and NiO phase were an active site for promoting the adsorption of CO₂ and H₂ on catalyst surface, high possibility of surface reaction between these two adsorbed species 752 753 were occurred and finally the reaction rate was enhanced. However, excess amount of adsorbed CO₂ on surface can inhibit the H₂ adsorption and lead to lowering of CO₂ rate. 754

755

# 756 Acknowledgements

The authors gratefully acknowledge the facility support from Khon Kaen University,
Institute for catalysis (Hokkaido University, Japan) for X-ray diffraction and N₂ adsorptiondesorption analysis and Synchrotron Light Research Institute (Public Organization), Nakhon
Ratchasima, Thailand for XAS analysis.

# 761 **Reference**

762 [1] J. Gao, Y. Wang, Y. Ping, D. Hu, G. Xu, F. Gu, F. Su, RSC Adv. 2, (2012), 2358-2368.

763 [2] W. Li, H. Wang, X. Jiang, J. Zhu, Z. Liu, X. Gao, C. Song, RSC Adv. 8, (2018), 76517669.

765 [3] J. Gao, Q. Liu, F. Gu, B. Liu, Z. Zhong, F. Su, RSC Adv. 5, (2015), 22759-22776.

- 766 [4] M.S. Duyar, A. Ramachandran, C. Wang, R.J. Farrauto, J. CO₂ Util. 12, (2015), 27-33.
- 767 [5] D.C. Upham, A.R. Derk, S. Sharma, H. Metiu, E.W. McFarland, Catal. Sci. Technol. 5,
  768 (2015), 1783-1791.
- M. Schubert, S. Pokhrel, A. Thomé, V. Zielasek, T.M. Gesing, F. Roessner, L. Mädler,
  M. Bäumer, Cat. Sci. Technol. 6, (2016), 7449-7460.
- 771 [7] P. Panagiotopoulou, Appl., Catal. A. 542, (2017), 63-70.
- 772 [8] J. Gao, Q. Liu, F. Gu, B. Liu, Z. Zhong, F. Su, RSC Adv. 5, (2015), 22759-22776.
- 773 [9] H.C. Wu, Y.C. Chang, J.H. Wu, J.H. Lin, I.K. Lin, C.S. Chen, Catal. Sci. Technol. 5,
  774 (2015), 4154-4163.
- 775 [10] R. Zhou, N. Rui, Z. Fan, C.J. Liu, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy. 41, (2016), 22017-22025.
- 776 [11] J. Ashok, M.L. Ang, S. Kawi, Catal. Today. 281, (2017), 304-311.
- 777 [12] L.A.A. Varilla, N. Seriani, J.A. Montoya, J. Mol. Model. 25, (2019), 1-8.
- 778 [13] Y.X. Pan, C.J. Kia, D. Mei, Q. Ge, Langmuir. 26, (2010), 5551-5558.
- 779 [14] X. Li, Z.J. Zhao, L. Zeng, J. Zhao, H. Tian, S. Chen, K. Li, S. Sang, J. Gong. Chem.
  780 Sci., 9, (2018), 3426-3437.
- 781 [15] B. Li, H. Metiu, J. Phys. Chem. 114, (2010), 12234-12244.
- 782 [16] X. Yan, Y. Liu, B. Zhao, Z. Wang, Y. Wang, C.J. Lia, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy. 38,
  783 (2013), 2283-2291.
- [17] A. Niltrarach, S. Kityakarn, A. Worayingyong, J.T. Thienprasert, W. Klysubun, P.
   Songsiriritthigul, S. Limpijumnong. Phys B Condens Matter. 407, (2012), 2915-2918.
- 786 [18] X. Su, J. Xu, B. Liang, H. Duan, B. Hou, J. Energy. Chem. 25, (2016), 553-565.
- [19] Q. Liu, J. Gao, F. Gu, X. Lu, Y. Liu, H. Li, Z. Zhong, B. Liu, G. Xu, F. Su, J. Catal. 326,
  (2015), 127-138.
- 789 [20] P. Kidkhunthod, Adv. Nat. Sci. Nanosci. Nanotechnol. 8 (2017).
- W. Klysubun, P. Kidkhunthod, P. Tarawarakarn, P. Sombunchoo, C. Kongmark, S.
  Limpijumnong, S. Rujirawat, R. Yimnirun, G. Tumcharern, K. Faungnawakij, J.
  Synchrotron Radiat. 24, (2017), 707-716.

- 793 [22] X. Gao, A. Traitangwong, M. Hu, C. Zuo, V. Meeyoo, Z. Peng, C. Li, Energy Fuels. 32,
  794 (2018), 3681-3689.
- 795 [23] V.R. Akshay, B. Arun, G. Mandal, M. Vasandhara, Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys. 21,
  796 (2019), 2519-2532.
- 797 [24] M. Manzoor, A. Rafiq, M. Ikram, M. Nafees, S. Ali, Int. Nano Lett, 8, (2018), 1-8.
- [25] I. Ganesh, A.K. Kumar, P.P. Kumar, P.S.C. Sekhar, K. Radha, G. Padmanabham, G.
  Sundararajan, Sci World J. 2012, 2012, 13-20.
- 800 [26] P.M. Shirage, A.K. Rana, Y. Kumar, S. Sen, S.G. Leonardi, G. Neri, RCS Adv. 6,
  801 (2016), 82733-82742.
- 802 [27] K.C. Chanapattharapol, S. Krachuamram, Y. Poo-arporn, Solid State Sci. 99, (2020),
  803 106066.
- 804 [28] S. Tiwari, G. Bajpai, T. Srivastava, S. Viswakarma, P. Shirage, S. Sen, S. Biring, Scr.
  805 Mater. 129, (2017), 84-87.
- 806 [29] S.V. Moghaddam, M. Rezaei, F. Meshkani, R. Daroughegi, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy. 43,
  807 (2018), 16522-16533.
- [30] J. van de Loosdrecht, A.M. van de Kraan, A.J. van Dillen, J.W. Geus, J. Catal. 170,
  (1997), 217-226.
- 810 [31] S.W. Ho, C.Y. Chu, S.G. Chen, J. Catal. 178, (1998), 34-48.
- [32] J. Liu, C. Li, F. Weng, S. He, H. Chen, Y. Zhao, M. Wei, D.G. Evans, X. Duan, Catal.
  Sci. Technol. 3, (2013), 2627-2633.
- 813 [33] X. Meng, C. Wan, Y. Wang, X. Ju, J. Alloys Comp. 735, (2018), 1637-1647.
- 814 [34] K.I. Pandya, R.W. Hoffman, J. McBeen, W.E. O'Grady, J. Electrochem. Soc. 137, 1990,
  815 383-388.
- 816 [35] F. Farges, G.E. Brown Jr, J.J. Rehr, Phys. Rev. B. 56, (1997), 1809-1819.
- 817 [36] A. Sharma, M. Varshney, H.J. Shin, B.H. Lee, K.H. Chae, S. O. Won, Mater. Chem.
  818 Phys.191, (2017), 129-144.
- [37] J.H. Yang, H. Piao, A. Vinu, A.A. Elzatahty, S.M. Paek, J.H. Choy, RCS, Adv. 5,
  (2015), 8210-8215.

- 821 [38] B. Bharti, S. Kumar, H.N. Lee, R. Kumar, Sci Rep, 6, (2016), 1-12.
- [39] M. Sahoo, A.K. Yadav, S. Ghosh, S.N. Jha, D. Bhattacharyya, T. Mathews, Phys.
  Chem. Chem. Chem. Phys. 21, (2019), 6198-6206.
- [40] B.J. Hsieh, M.C. Tsai, C.J. Pan, W.N. Su, J. Rick, J.F. Lee, Y.W. Yang, B.J. Hwang,
  NPG Asia Mat, 9, (2017), e403.
- 826 [41] K. Huang, K. Sasaki, R.R. Adzic, Y. Xing, J. Mater. Chem. 22, (2012), 16824-16832.
- [42] H. Song, T.G. Jeong, Y.H. Moon, H.W. Chun, K.Y. Chung, H.S. Kim, B.W. Cho, Y.T.
  Kim, Sci. Rep. 4, (2015), 1-8.
- [43] L. Huang, L. Yan, M. Tang, G. Wang, Z. Qin, H. Ge, ACS Omega, 3, (2018), 1896718975)
- [44] J.A. Rodriguez, J.C. Hanson, A.I. Frenkel, J.Y. Kim, M. Pe´rez, J. Am. Chem. Soc,
  124, (2002), 346-354.
- [45] D. Hu, J. Gao, Y. Ping, L. Jia, P. Gunawan, Z. Zhong, G. Xu, F. Gu, F. Su, Ind. Eng.
  Chem. Res. 51, (2012), 4875-4886.
- 835 [46] P. van Helden, J.A. van den Berg, I.M. Ciobi^{ca}, Catal. Sci. Technol. 2, (2012) 491836 494.
- 837 [47] W. Göpel, G. Rocker, R. Feierabend, Phys. Rev. B. 28, (1983), 3427-3438.
- [48] J. Xu, X. Su, H. Duan, B. Hou, Q. Lin, X. Liu, X. Pan, G. Pei, H. Geng, Y. Huang, T.
  Zhang, J. Catal. 333, (2016), 227-237.
- 840 [49] X. Jia, X. Zhang, N. Rui, X. Hu, C. Liu, Appl. Catal. B Environ. 244, (2019), 159-169.
- [50] F. Wang, S. He, H. Chen, B. Wang, L. Zheng, M. Wei, D.G. Evans, X. Duan, J. Am.
  Chem. Soc. 138, (2016), 6298-6305.
- [51] M.Y.S. Hamid, M.L. Firmansyah, S. Triwahyono, A.A. Jalil, R.R. Mukti, E.
  Febriyanti, V. Suendo, H.D. Setiabudi, M. Mohamed, W. Nabgan, Appl. Catal. A. 532,
  (2017), 86-94.
- [52] M. Pudukudy, Z. Yaakob, A. Kadier, M.S. Takriff, N.S.M. Hassan, Int. J. Hydrogen
  Energy. 42, (2017), 16495-16513.