



HOKKAIDO UNIVERSITY

Title	The Thought of Kingo Miyabe, Kanzo Uchimura, and Inazo Nitobe : Independence, Tolerance, Nature, Health, and Views of Women in Japanese Christianity [an abstract of entire text]
Author(s)	Komasin, Stephanie Midori
Description	この博士論文全文の閲覧方法については、以下のサイトをご参照ください。 https://www.lib.hokudai.ac.jp/dissertations/copy-guides/
Degree Grantor	北海道大学
Degree Name	博士(文学)
Dissertation Number	甲第15660号
Issue Date	2023-09-25
Doc URL	https://hdl.handle.net/2115/90769
Type	doctoral thesis
File Information	Stephanie_Komasin_summary.pdf



学位論文内容の要約

博士の専攻分野の名称：博士（文学）

氏名：Stephanie Midori Komasin

学位論文題名

The Thought of Kingo Miyabe, Kanzo Uchimura, and Inazo Nitobe: Independence, Tolerance, Nature, Health, and Views of Women in Japanese Christianity

（宮部金吾、内村鑑三、新渡戸稲造の思想：

日本のキリスト教における独立、寛容、自然、健康、女性観）

In Chapter 1, I explain why the Sapporo Band (hereafter, SB) differs from other Japanese Christian Bands of the Meiji period, and why this thesis focuses on the religious thought of the Believers in Jesus (hereafter, BJ) through to 1900 - the SB proper - and my interpretation that the SB is a religious movement. I cover which types of primary and secondary source material that this thesis makes use of and why it draws from these archive collections and focuses on these thinkers.

As critical engagement with previous studies, I note that several stories about William Smith Clark, the early years of Sapporo Agricultural College (hereafter, SAC), the SB, Kanzo Uchimura, and Inazo Nitobe appear regularly in popular and scholarly sources but lack primary source citations as evidence for these well-accepted anecdotes; while some authors provide sources for these anecdotes, the sources themselves are often secondary sources which, if they in turn provide citation at all, provide it to further secondary sources. A recurring problem is that some anecdotes disagree with existing primary records and firsthand accounts. I have uncovered historical records that support some of these legends and undermine others. By way of my methodology, I am pleased to be able to contribute answers to at least a few by examining the historical record.

I introduce the themes and tasks of this thesis. Firstly, if Clark had a formative impact on the SB (and, more generally, SAC), the origin of the ambition, morals, ethics, and religious thought of its members begins with the intellectual and religious formation of Clark. Saying Clark was an American, New Englander, Christian, Protestant, or Puritan is convenient, but utterly inadequate as an explanation. Many of his contemporary professional missionaries and non-Japanese foreigners hired by the Japanese government for a mixture of their specialized knowledge and/or English teaching, as part of the Meiji government's modernization efforts were all of these things, but they did not leave the same legacy as he did. What made the SB's case different and significant? Why did SAC latch onto the spirit of "Boys, Be Ambitious!" but their Japanese contemporaries did not receive that same message and identity from each of the other Americans living in Japan who came from Maine, Vermont, New Hampshire, Massachusetts, Connecticut, or Rhode Island? Why were the BJ equipped to fend off absorption into a denomination after Clark left? Which aspects of the SB's religious thought are 'Clarkean'? The answer must be something that is true of Clark but not universally true of every other Christian in the colonial northeast region of the United States. Secondly, I pledge to strike new ground by looking at themes of Dissenter heritage, and homing in on specific themes in the religious thought of three members of the SB: Uchimura's views of religious tolerance and economic independence, including his view of history; Nitobe's views of religion and women, including his view of mysticism; and Miyabe's views of health and women's education, including his view of spousal collaboration

in academic research. Some may doubt whether Nitobe's view of women or Miyabe's view of women's education have any useful contribution to make to the field of Religious Studies because the SB were comprised of male professors and male students, but they saw great importance in the status of women in society and in women's education.

In Chapter 2, I investigate the question of 'Was Clark a Puritan?' by comparing him with the definitions of 'Puritan' and 'puritan' according to the *Oxford English Dictionary*, *The Cambridge Companion to Puritanism*, and *The Oxford History of Protestant Dissenting Traditions* in regard to purity and purity practices, ambition, abstinence from alcohol and smoking, health, Moral Education (a.k.a. Ethics), and world religions (in particular, Shintoism). To answer these questions, I probe primary sources by Brooks, William Wheeler, Clark, and Uchimura. I conclude that Clark is only 'Puritan' under the widest definition which includes all of the demographics that the Church of England expelled against their will and the minority groups who left it willingly, and well as all of their descendants who resided in New England, but that that is not a satisfying way to conceptualize who Clark was, and is so wide-ranging as a category that it is not particularly valuable for capturing his specific influences on the SB in a way that differs from everyone else the BJ encountered while they studied abroad in the Northeast of the United States. Neither does that portrait explain why Brooks was at pains to endorse Clark to a critical crowd of Massachusetts people who would, nearly-entirely, be under that same wide umbrella of worldview. It also fails to explain why the SB inherited keenly-felt values of independence, tolerance, and ambition that Japanese Christians converted by other British and American Protestants in Japan did not.

In light of these findings, Chapter 3 posits an alternate, tighter explanation for the values that Clark and his selected SAC professors passed to their SAC students - the Dissenter heritage of the SB. After covering the *Oxford English Dictionary's* definitions of 'Dissent,' 'Dissenter,' 'Nonconformist,' 'Independent,' and 'dissent,' and *The Oxford History of Protestant Dissenting Traditions's* definition of 'Protestant Dissenting traditions,' I introduce the concept of 'Dissenter heritage' as religious groups that have been cross-pollinated by thought of the Dissenter traditions at some remove from the groups that grew out of Dissent and Nonconformism in Britain, but include important ideas absorbed from Dissenter writings and/or from formative interactions with a Dissenting tradition's denomination or interactions with individual members of a Dissenting tradition (whether aware or unaware of this history). This postcolonial perspective of 'selection' stands in contrast to concepts such as 'selective incorporation,' 'syncretism,' 'inculturation,' '(D)issent,' and '(d)issent.' I next explain the origin of tolerance, which was religious, Christian, and Dissenter in nature, and then introduce the Dissenter irony of tolerance in independence in the life of John Locke, author of the 1689 *A Letter Concerning Toleration (Epistola de Tolerantia)*. I then assess Clark as expressing Lockean tolerance in his selection of Unitarian colleagues Wheeler and Brooks, openness to BJ baptisms from Anglican Walter Denning and Methodist-Episcopal Merriman Colbert Harris, and pride in the SB's undenominational Christianity.

In Chapter 4, I explore the SB's amalgamation of Protestant Dissenting tradition influences inherited from their original Trinitarian Congregationalist and devout Unitarian SAC faculty members with a close examination of each one's thought to show how the professors each individually influenced the SB's religious outlook. Within this chapter, I not only unearth details about these Americans from American source materials, I also illuminate their experiences and values from their own writings and their relationships with the BJ from their students' writings. I begin with relevant points about Congregationalism, and then delve deeply into Clark's conservative, evangelistic Congregationalist environment, education, career, relationships, and even study abroad experience where he encountered philanthropists, missionaries, and the concept of 'the conserved boy,' and demonstrated preference for independent church and conservative education. I then detail how Clark's *Covenant of the*

Believers in Jesus is Congregationalist in format, is sensitive to his non-Trinitarian coworkers, and eschews dogmas in favor of practical simplicity and sustainability. Much, if not all, of Clark's thought and speech among his SAC students is filtered through his Dissenting tradition, and some of it is much more specifically Congregationalist than it is Puritan or generally Protestant.

Next, I turn to Clark's colleagues, beginning with fellow conservative Congregationalist, David Pearce Penhallow, introduce pertinent points about Unitarianism, and then present Wheeler's and Brooks' religious thought and practices (including Wheeler's point of connection to Transcendentalist Unitarian minister Ralph Waldo Emerson [1803-1882] and Brooks' interactions with various missionaries to Japan). After this, although these are examples of non-religious dissent, I also take a look at Clark, Wheeler, and Brooks' experience with dissension from students to professors at Massachusetts Agricultural College and SAC. This chapter argues that these Christian professors demonstrated religious tolerance and an active religious lifestyle to the BJ as they embodied the religious thought, convictions, and praxis of their Protestant Dissenting traditions at SAC, and identifies characteristics about these faiths, principles, and practices that the BJ admired.

Chapters 5, 6, and 7 each highlight specific issues that these professors and members of the SB took shared and especial interest in, while underscoring ways in which the SB brought their Japanese, independent, Christian religious perspective to interface with these topics. It is important to recognize how the Dissenter and Protestant Dissenting traditions that form the Dissenter heritage of the Sapporo Band provided a Western inheritance for the SB to mine for fashioning their Eastern independent Christianity. However, Miyabe, Uchimura, and Nitobe were not merely parroting others' views when they took in British and American religious thought - they responded to influences uniquely from their generally-Japanese and specifically-Sapporo resident perspectives. In my view, memories of the BJ's church of on-campus dormitory meetings and off-campus wilderness worship formed the continual measure that they evaluated other forms of Christianity against throughout their lives. In these chapters, I also point out and criticize discrepancies between ideals and reality.

The first portion of Chapter 5 considers Uchimura's view of religious tolerance, beginning with the History leg of his three-legged view of faith; I analyze his framework of History to see if, where, and how religion and religious dissent fit within his view of World History. I comb through this with a particular eye out for Uchimura's view of Dissenters and Protestant Dissenting traditions, and conclude that Anson Daniel Morse's (1846-1916) inadequate portrayal of a secular, political view of History at Amherst College failed Uchimura, but that Uchimura was able to offset this thanks to the influence of Dissenter thought from the SAC Library (especially former Burgher Seceder Thomas Carlyle [1795-1881] and William Penn [1644-1718], founder of the group that had originally called themselves 'Children of the Light' or 'Friends of the Truth' and who their critics called 'Quakers,' but later became known as 'the Religious Society of Friends'), and then Uchimura revised his view through interactions with Congregationalists, Unitarians, and Quakers in Japan and abroad. Throughout, I show how his valuation of tolerance in religion is situated in the independence of his Dissenter heritage position. While Uchimura did not always succeed in joint ministry with Christians in contemporary Dissenting traditions, they trained his view of religious tolerance. Being an indigenous Japanese Christian and the trials of sore experiences refined Uchimura's view that he should tolerate other faiths from his independence and that he deserved toleration for his independence by other faiths. Uchimura's view is true respect for independent faith, heresy, and the beauty in other religions and in other faith expressions that does not presume to encroach upon others to coerce conversion to one's own view.

The second portion of Chapter 5 covers Uchimura's view of economic independence. The

contours of the BJ' s indigenous church format and experience are the formative origin of religious independence and - in order to protect it - economic independence in Uchimura' s thought. Clark introduced scientific Christian work, the Bible, and Christian meetings to the BJ, but they discovered their own approaches and came to their own insights. I first draw attention to the features of the BJ' s church and ecclesiology, including remote locality, Nature, simplicity, pastoral care, leadership in democracy, self-sufficiency, and intimate fellowship. After this, I contrast the bitter cause of Uchimura' s negative view of economic dependence with the SAC professors' responsible financial stewardship that preceded the SB' s tenacity in getting out of debt. To do so, I delineate the roles of J.C. Davison and Denning in the SB' s traumatic financial crisis, but highlight Uchimura' s postmortem interpretation and conclusion that dependence upon a larger religious organization for money hinders religious dissent. I bring forward the responsible handling of money that Wheeler and Brooks modeled at SAC, Uchimura' s view as the SB' s treasurer, and the SB' s use of tithes and financial independence as foundational in their *Declaration of Independence*. Uchimura' s view of economic independence is native to the BJ environment and faced tenacious philanthropic challengers in Philadelphia. I also inspect Uchimura' s view of the pitfalls of salaried clergy. Together, these elements ingrained themselves into his long-term thought on safeguarding religious independence by economic independence. To close the chapter, I posit that Uchimura is a primary culprit in propagating the idea that Clark' s "Boys, be ambitious!" outlook is a product of Clark' s 'Puritan' environment, but that this view stems from Morse' s class rather than from Clark, and I suggest two main reasons that Uchimura felt comfortable with attributing Clark' s ambition to Puritans. I also point out discrepancy between Uchimura' s declared views of economic independence and his own finances.

Unlike Miyabe and Uchimura, who maintained independent Japanese Christianity to the end of their lives, Nitobe' s Dissenter heritage mindset metamorphized from being anti-sects to being Quaker. The first part of Chapter 6 begins with Nitobe' s view of religion itself, including his definition of 'religion' and his view of human nature. I then focus in on his view of mysticism, where he connected his pre-Christian childhood experiences with the Quaker practice of silent waiting; he had a religious experience with his wife, Mary Patterson Elkington Nitobe (1857-1857) that promised to bless their community if they would "listen intently" to God' s guidance; and he described unmet yearning for mystical encounter that he believed others had had. Nitobe chose the Dissenting tradition of Quakerism from the standpoint of assessing it against the Sapporo ideal of his Dissenter heritage, so I next explore Nitobe' s general view of the Religious Society of Friends. In addition to his view of contemporaneous Quaker parliamentarian John Bright (1811-1889), pacifism, etc., I solve a long-standing mystery about the identity of Mary' s family member who bequeathed the money that the Nitobes invested into Sapporo *Enyu* Night School and then offer five intersections between this information and Nitobe' s thought and practice that run more deeply and extensively than a one-time bequeath.

The second part of Chapter 6 presents Nitobe' s view of women, including his view that could now be considered a nuanced type of gender essentialism, advocacy for elevating the status of women in society, and interactions with women. I substantiate that the SB' s SAC life did not unfold in a male vacuum (during the BJ' s undergraduate years and during the years when some of them taught at SAC, they encountered a number of women), and touch upon his usage of the words 'feminism' and 'feminist' and the extent of his communications with Japanese women before I delineate his view. Within the segment on his nuanced gender essentialism, I include the gender roles of his somewhat atypical mother and wife. I identify Nitobe' s view of feminine virtues and weaknesses, and show that his Christianity and his Japanese-ness are integral to his perspective on these attributes. I then introduce his "New View of Women" of intentional cultivation of morality through religion, discernment, humanitarian work, and respect. I close the chapter with a critique of the gap between

Nitobe's ideal image of motherhood and his real-world perspective on mothers. Throughout, I note when his view differs significantly from those of other Meiji intellectuals, such as contemporaneous gender essentialism which drew a strict, oppositional binary or the *Ryosai Kenbo* ('Good Wife, Wise Mother') theory of women.

In contrast to Uchimura and Nitobe, who left Sapporo and its church, Miyabe resided in Sapporo until his death and conserved a highly-distilled form of the SB movement. He exemplifies full integration of Dissenting traditions with the needs of his local community and through correspondence with the SB members who relocated. In the first section of Chapter 7, I open with the religious necessity that the BJ attribute to Miyabe's scientific vocation. His view of health involves a theologically-tolerant flavor, where his view that people are human animals who must obey the laws of nature combines Christian Creation with Charles Darwin's (1809-1882) theory of evolution and is influenced by Asa Gray (1810-1888) and Jane Lathrop Loring Gray's (1821-1909) religiously-tolerant marriage. I demonstrate that Miyabe's holistic view of health involves both biological health as well as spiritual cultivation. This view retains the conservative Congregationalist essence of Williston Seminary's Military Drill, and Miyabe applies his view in advising and assisting others in their physical health. I highlight his life-long commitment to work/life balance, and why overwork is dangerous to longevity and undercuts the goal of usefulness.

In the second section of Chapter 7, I shift to a more specific scope: Miyabe's view of women's education. I begin with an overview of the Northern (Hokkaido, Tohoku) and Christian leadership in Japan's education for girls and women from the youngest ages up through university research. I establish that Miyabe's religious thought inspired him in effectively developing girls' and women's education through charity work at Smith Girls' School/Hokusei Girls' School, Toyohira Sunday School, and Sapporo *Enyu* Night School. I show that SAC professors supported women's education, I contrast Miyabe's views of Western women's education opportunities and quality with that in Japan, and I share his religious thought on what he hoped for women. I argue that Miyabe implemented advances in women's education through Tohoku Imperial University Council's university ordinance and Hokkaido Imperial University's Women's Admission Investigation Committee. I then highlight his ideal of spousal collaboration in academic research, including his views of engagement, marriage, and husbands and wives collaborating on professional, academic, and scientific work. Finally, I comment on a concerning possibility by taking a critical lens to the potentially-eugenic ramifications of some of his views.

Chapter 8 contains the Conclusion followed by Future Prospects. This thesis has aimed to show that the SB is - all at once - a Christianity native to Japanese thought and culture, a religious movement inheritor of Dissenter thought and Protestant Dissenting traditions, an anti-denominationalism independent church, a hybrid species born of many influences able to pragmatically sift influences without indiscriminately-absorbing ingredients wholesale. As a group of Dissenter heritage, the SB merges the inheritance of Japanese cultural knowledge and context with the inheritance of Dissenter religious independence, Lockean religious tolerance, and Carlylean conscience; Congregationalist evangelism, 'conserved boy' philosophy, and health; Unitarian piety, service, and Transcendentalist literary culture; Quaker simplicity, charity, and elevation of women; congregational ecclesiology; and SAC dormitory- and Hokkaido Nature-cultivated faith, economic independence, and scientific research as religious praxis - wrapped up in Clarkean ambition. This constellation of elements is more particular and distinct than a generically puritan, Puritan, Protestant, New Englander, or American worldview that entered Japan elsewhere through other internationals recruited by the Japanese government and missionaries.

Clark, Wheeler, Penhallow, and Brooks could not possibly have brought their Christian selves to SAC without their Protestant Dissenting traditions. Even having an evangelistic attitude and handing out Bibles in the first place is a product of their backgrounds: the

types of Congregationalists and the kinds of Unitarians that they came from. Yet the SB aspired to be a pure, independent, Japanese Christianity. In this, they tried to balance reverence for their instructors, for whom they felt gratitude and admiration, and their own status as independent. The SAC faculty members transmitted more than raw data to the BJ; perhaps the most interesting thing they accomplished was intentionally facilitating the BJ's independence. I have introduced the term 'Dissenter heritage,' which carefully presents the SB's status as neither Puritans, Dissenters, nor members of Protestant Dissenting traditions (i. e., not a Congregational, Unitarian, Anglican, or Methodist-Episcopal church plant), but as a type of independent Japanese Christianity that inherited imported specific influences; I also offered the concept of the Dissenter irony of tolerance in independence. The term 'Dissenter heritage' respects the historical route of transmission of ideas, values, and practices, as well as honors active rebuffing of any 'contaminants' that do not suit a native demographic of people who craft their unique, amalgamated, indigenous Christianity. Instead of generic 'Japanese' Christianity, the independent and natural environment of SAC facilitated development of the original thought, simple liturgy, and steadfast brotherhood of the BJ. Instead of naively accepting sources of authority and doctrines presented to them by others after their graduation from college, the SB evaluated differing perspectives and customs by the convictions they formed in their dorm rooms and Hokkaido forests.

After carefully looking into the matter, Clark does not fit the profile of a 'Puritan' or 'puritan,' and Clark is not single-handedly responsible for the religious thought of the SB. Until scholars devote the same amount of attention to Wheeler, Penhallow, Brooks, John Clarence Cutter (1851-1909), Cecil Hobart Peabody (1855-1934), Horace Edward Stockbridge (1857-1830), and Milton Haight (1855-1896), how much each of these early SAC instructors contributed to the thought of the SB, and how religious/independent/ambitious each one was remains to be answered, but this thesis has shed light on Clark, Wheeler, Penhallow, and Brooks in regard to the themes of this paper and clarified that looking only to Clark as the source of the SB's thought is a regrettable oversight, because Clark's handpicked colleagues were vital influences on the BJ. From these professors' influence in combination with the BJ's innovative church life, the SB developed their religious thought and practices.

This thesis follows Brooks' opinion that Clark's ambition is not part of his religious thought or American background: that Clark was not a typical New Englander. Clark's innate ambition interfaced with the ambition that the SAC students already felt compelled by, offering them a rousing, constructive, and workable vocabulary for what they were feeling. The SB's characteristic identity as 'ambitious' is particularly Clarkean.

This thesis took up themes close to the hearts of Miyabe, Uchimura, and Nitobe. Many of the ideas they shared are generally things they shared with the Dissenters, Clark, Wheeler, Penhallow, and Brooks. However, each gravitated to different parts of this inheritance: Uchimura and Nitobe to Religion, Miyabe and Uchimura to religious independence, Miyabe and Nitobe to women's status in society, Miyabe to holistic health, Uchimura to dissenting, and Nitobe to mysticism. In all of these, I highlighted their indigenous Dissenter heritage values. I revised my originally more modest claims about disparate 'points of connection' between Dissent, Protestant Dissenting traditions, and the SB to affirm what I see as the 'Dissenter heritage of the Sapporo Band.'

I have applied this 'Dissenter heritage' concept to the SB in this thesis, and suggested that the term can be employed in discussions of the SB's descendant groups as well, but I also believe that the concept has wider application to any entities anywhere that, similarly, receive Dissenter and/or Dissenting traditions influence but are not Dissenters or Dissenting traditions themselves (such as indigenous churches, simple churches, house churches, campus evangelism, Business as Mission [BAM], tentmaker missions, organizations, research groups, study groups, etc.). I am interested to explore this prospect, and would welcome other scholars examining it as well.

The present study has brought into scholarly discourse the handwritten letters of Miyabe and Brooks (in particular, materials housed in the Hokkaido University Archives; the Hokkaido University Northern Studies Collection in the Hokkaido University Library; the Hokkaido University Botanical Garden Book Materials; the Hokkaido University Botanical Garden; and the William Penn Brooks Papers in the Robert S. Cox Special Collections and University Archives Research Center, UMass Amherst Libraries), whose faith and thought have slipped under the radar in the field of Religious Studies, but further research is called upon for discussion of these extant letters. Other future prospects include researching primary source materials in the Friends Historical Library in McCabe Library at Swarthmore College, the Swarthmore College Peace Collection, the Haverford College Quaker & Special Collections, Hokusei Gakuen University Library, and other largely-untapped repositories. Many aspects of the SAC professors' religious views remain unevaluated, and countless unexplored themes remain available to study regarding the BJ, SB, Sapporo Christian Church, and related groups and individuals. More broadly, comparative studies within Christianity is becoming standard in Western academia under the term 'World Christianities' and recent books catalogue many groups in Asia, but they have not thus far considered the SB, *Mukyoukai*, Original Gospel MAKUYA, etc. Making comparisons between the religious thought, history, and political philosophy of the SB and the English Dissenters falls within this emerging topic of high interest.